

**MINUTES OF THE STATE COMMITTEE
OF THE LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON SATURDAY, JANUARY 31, 2021
ON THE ZOOM MEETING APP AND PORCUPINE APP**

Note: This meeting is a continuation of the meeting that began on January 23, 2021.

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m. by William Cody Anderson, Chair. The Chair issued welcoming remarks. A roll call of voting members was conducted by Andrew Kolstee, Secretary. 38 of 67 Members of the State Committee were present at the time of roll call; Anthony Pellegrino, Stacey Prussman, Ilya Schwartzburg, and Duane Whitmer later entered the meeting.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Ilya Schwartzburg, Judicial District 1
Stacey H. Prussman, Judicial District 2
William Cody Anderson, Judicial District 3
Jay A. Carr, Judicial District 3
Todd G. Haggerty, Judicial District 3
Lora L. Newell, Judicial District 3
Robert M. Arrigo, Judicial District 4
John A. Janes, Judicial District 4
Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson, Judicial District 4
Brandon G. Lyon, Judicial District 4
Rachel E. Becker, Judicial District 5
Milva E. Dordal, Judicial District 5
David E. Fite, Judicial District 5
Sean S. Stevens, Judicial District 5
Mark S. Braiman, Judicial District 6
Timothy M. O'Connor, Judicial District 6
Christopher M. Olenski, Judicial District 6
Richard F. Purtell, Judicial District 6
Thomas D. Quiter, Judicial District 6
Paul C. Sechrist, Judicial District 6
Steven G. Becker, Judicial District 7
Anthony D'Orazio, Judicial District 7
James M. Dayton, Judicial District 7
Mark E. Glogowski, Judicial District 7
Sean C. Phelan, Judicial District 7
Erin M. Becker, Judicial District 8
Andrew M. Kolstee, Judicial District 8
Peyton D. Kunselman, Judicial District 8
Francis Law, Judicial District 8
F. Patrick Mahoney, Jr., Judicial District 8
Leonard E. Morlock, Judicial District 8
Duane J. Whitmer, Judicial District 8
Daniel P. Donnelly, Judicial District 9
Pietro S. Geraci, Judicial District 9
Robert J. Greibesland, Judicial District 9

Anthony W. Pellegrino, Judicial District 9
Michael A. Arcati, Judicial District 11
Gabrielle Cordova, Judicial District 11
Irwin Mark Weinblatt, Judicial District 11
Richard Bell, Judicial District 13
Susan B. Overeem-Cummings, Judicial District 13
Paul M. Grindle, Member-At-Large, Executive Committee

MEMBERS ABSENT

Mark N. Axinn, Judicial District 1
Gilbert L. Midonnet, Judicial District 2
Matthew I. Morgan, Judicial District 2
Gary S. Popkin, Judicial District 2
Nathan P. Dunn, Judicial District 4
Zachary D. Remian, Judicial District 4
Shawn Hannon, Judicial District 5
Craig A. Miles, Judicial District 5
Kari Bittner, Judicial District 7
Eric A. Cooper, Judicial District 7
Andrew C. Hollister, Judicial District 7
James P. Russell, Judicial District 7
Kevin A. Wilson, Judicial District 7
Kathleen M. Ligammari, Judicial District 8
Tara L. Scrivano, Judicial District 8
William K. Schmidt, Judicial District 9
Deepak Bansal, Judicial District 10
Gary L. Donoyan, Judicial District 10
Kenneth Epstein, Judicial District 10
Carmen Horan, Judicial District 10
Bobby K. Kalotee, Judicial District 10
Satinder Kaur, Judicial District 10
Mahavir Singh, Judicial District 10
Aaron A. Commey, Judicial District 12
Enmanuel H. Torres, Judicial District 12

OBSERVERS

Chase D. Tkach, Candidate for Judicial Committee
Timothy "TJ" Ferreira, Porcupine Administrator

Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **suspend the Special Rules of Order to consider amendments to the Special Rules or Order** was seconded by Anthony D’Orazio and passed 22-3 with 2 abstentions without debate.

Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **adopt the amended “Special Rules of Order of the Libertarian Party of New York for the State Committee Meeting Held on January 23, 2021 and Continued on January 31, 2021” (Exhibit 1)** was seconded by Anthony D’Orazio and passed 31-2 without debate.

Secretary Andrew Kolstee issued a Credentials and Nominations report (**Exhibit 2**). The following individuals were entered into nomination for the position of Member of the Judicial Committee at the January 23, 2021 session of the meeting of the State Committee.

Steven G. Becker, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
Mark S. Braiman, nominated by Timothy M. O’Connor
James Dayton, nominated by Lora L. Newell
Milva E. Dordal, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
David E. Fite, nominated by Pietro S. Geraci
Melvin H. Foster, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
Shawn Hannon, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
Peyton D. Kunselman, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
Francis Law, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
Thomas D. Quiter, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
William Schmidt, nominated by Lora L. Newell
Chase D. Tkach, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer
Christian J. Vondras, nominated by Pietro S. Geraci
Kevin A. Wilson, nominated by Andrew M. Kolstee

Since the first session of the meeting, Mark Braiman and Thomas Quiter have withdrawn their nominations.

The Chair opened the floor to additional nominations for the Judicial Committee.

Anthony D’Orazio made a point of information in regard to “None of the Above” (NOTA) as a candidate.

In the first round of voting for the Judicial Committee, the results were as follows:

Candidate (vote for 9)	Votes	Percentage
NOTA	27	71.05%
Peyton Kunselman	9	23.68%
Steven Becker	8	21.05%
Shawn Hannon	7	18.42%
William Schmidt	7	18.42%
Milva Dordal	6	15.79%
Chase Tkach	6	15.79%
Karyn Keniry-Thompson	6	15.79%
Kevin Wilson	6	15.79%
James Dayton	4	10.53%
David Fite	4	10.53%
Francis Law	3	7.89%
Melvin Foster	2	5.26%
Christian Vondras	1	2.63%
Total Votes	38	100.00%
Total Voters	96	

Since no candidate received a two-thirds vote and NOTA received a majority vote and outpolled all other candidates, all candidates are dropped from the ballot.

Motion by Anthony D’Orazio to **suspend the Special Rules of Order to close the election of the Judicial Committee to resume at a more appropriate time** was seconded by Andrew Kolstee and passed 34-0, with 1 abstention.

Andrew Kolstee issued a report of the Executive Committee (**Exhibit 3**). Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **approve a hearing to be held by the State Committee in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to revoke the affiliation of the County Organization in Niagara County** was debated and passed 30-4 with 1 abstention.

Andrew Kolstee issued a report of the Executive Committee (**Exhibit 3**). Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **approve a hearing to be held by the State Committee in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to remove Kathleen Ligammari as a Member of the State Committee from Judicial District 8 on the charges of filing fraudulent rules of a purported County Affiliate in Niagara County at the Niagara County Board of Elections** was debated and passed 33-6.

Andrew Kolstee issued a report of the Executive Committee (**Exhibit 3**). Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **approve a hearing to be held by the State Committee in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to remove Kenneth Epstein, Carmen**

Horan, Bobby Kalotee, and Mahavir Singh as Members of the State Committee from Judicial District 10 on the charges of filing fraudulent certificates of authorization for fourteen (14) candidates at the New York State Board of Elections, and filing fraudulent rules of purported County Affiliates in Nassau and Suffolk Counties at the Nassau and Suffolk County Board of Elections was debated and passed 33-4, with 1 abstention. Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **hold a hearing immediately in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to revoke the affiliation of the County Organization in Niagara County** was seconded by Mark Braiman and passed 33-6 without debate.

The State Committee discussed the consideration to revoke the affiliation of the County Organization in Niagara County. Francis Law, a former 1st Vice-Chair of the County Organization in Niagara County, spoke on his experience as a former officer of the County Organization.

Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **revoke the affiliation of the County Organization in Niagara County** was seconded by Pietro Geraci and passed 37-1, with 2 abstentions.

Motion by Andrew Kolstee to **hold the next meeting of the full State Committee on Sunday, February 21, 2021 at 1:00 p.m. via Zoom for the purpose of 1) holding a hearing in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to remove Kathleen Ligammari as a Member of the State Committee from Judicial District 8, 2) holding a hearing in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to remove Kenneth Epstein, Carmen Horan, Bobby Kalotee, and Mahavir Singh as Members of the State Committee from Judicial District 10, and 3) conducting any other business the Executive Committee deems necessary** was seconded by Sean Phelan, debated, and passed 35-3, with 2 abstentions.

The Chair constituted a special committee for the purpose of reviewing Article 10 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in regard to the Judicial Committee with Milva Dordal as Chair and Richard Bell, David Fite, Pietro Geraci, Robert Greibesland, Christopher Olenski, Sean Phelan, Thomas Quiter, and Christian Vondras as members.

Motion by David Fite to **constitute a standing Youth Outreach Committee** was withdrawn as the Chair ruled that youth outreach falls under the purview of the existing Public Engagement Committee.

Motion by Pietro Geraci to **appoint Mark Braiman as chair of the Platform Committee** was seconded by Timothy O'Connor and passed 29-6, with 2 abstentions.

Motion by Paul Grindle to **constitute a standing Program Committee** was withdrawn as the Chair ruled that a constituting a program falls under the purview of the existing Legislative Affairs Committee.

Motion by Paul Sechrist to adjourn was seconded by James Dayton and passed 27-5.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:22 p.m.

Andrew Martin Kolstee,
Secretary

Exhibit 1 (page 1 of 5)

Special Rules of Order of the Libertarian Party of New York for the State Committee Meeting Held on January 23, 2021 and Continued on January 31, 2021

As amended by the State Committee on January 31, 2021

Rule 1. **AGENDA.** The order of business shall be as follows:

- (a) The Chair shall call the meeting to order.
- (b) The Secretary shall call the roll to identify the elected State Committee members present.
- (c) Adoption of the Special Rules of Order of the State Committee Meeting.
- (d) Filling of vacancies on the State Committee.
- (e) Quorum report following the filling of vacancies.
- (f) Report of the Rules Committee and consideration of amendments.
- (g) Election of the Judicial Committee.
- (h) Old business.
- (i) New business.
- (j) Adjournment.

Rule 2. **CREDENTIALS.** The Secretary, directly after the opening ceremonies of the business meeting, shall call the roll of the elected members of the State Committee.

Rule 3. **IDENTIFICATION OF VOTING MEMBERS.** To facilitate identification, seating, and voting, members and others shall be required to retain and display upon request the wristbands, voting cards, or other indicia issued by the organizers of the meeting upon registration. Division votes, whether simple or counted, shall be taken by members' standing and display of such voting member indicia. For meetings held by teleconference, voting members shall be identified within the platform or platforms used to conduct the meeting.

Rule 4. **DEBATE.**

Rule 4.1. No member shall speak in debate on the same question a second time until every other member who wishes to speak had the opportunity to do so.

Rule 4.2. No member shall speak in debate on the same question more than twice or longer than three (3) minutes in total without permission of the State Committee granted by a two-thirds vote without debate.

Rule 5. **FILLING OF VACANCIES.** Vacancies on the State Committee shall be done in a manner as described in this Rule and in accordance with the Rules of the Libertarian Party.

Rule 5.1. Nominations for vacancies on the State Committee may be submitted by any member of the State Committee. If such nominations are received by the Secretary at least seven (7) days in advance of the meeting, the Secretary shall distribute the names of the nominees and any statement regarding their candidacy to all members of the State Committee at least five (5) days in advance of the meeting in which vacancies are to be voted upon. Once the filling of vacancies begins, the Secretary shall present the

Exhibit 1 (page 2 of 5)

nominations they received and all such qualified candidates that accepted the nomination shall be entered into nomination. Subsequent nominations may be made on the floor prior to the election to fill such vacancies. The Chair shall request that each nominee confirm that they are qualified to fill the vacancy and accept the nomination in order to be entered into nomination to fill the vacancy they seek.

Rule 5.2. For each district, the ballot shall contain all the names of the eligible nominees and identify the number of vacancies in the district. Each ballot shall contain NOTA as a candidate.

Rule 5.3. The election shall be held with approval voting and candidates with the most votes shall be elected to fill the vacancy or vacancies as long as they have received a majority of the vote of the voting members. If there is a tie in which two or more candidates have received a majority of the vote of the voting members and at least one vacancy still exists, an instant run-off vote shall occur. If NOTA receives a majority of the votes, there will be a new round of nominations and a new election, in which all of the nominated candidates who were outpolled by NOTA are ineligible.

Rule 5.4. Members of the Libertarian Party chosen to fill vacancies on the State Committee shall not be allowed to participate in the meeting until acceptance of the quorum report of the Secretary by the State Committee, scheduled to occur after the filling of vacancies; and in particular may not nominate, speak, or vote in any contested election for filling additional vacancies.

Rule 6. **ADOPTION AND AMENDMENT OF PARTY RULES.**

Rule 6.1. All proposed amendments of the Party Rules must be submitted in accordance with the Rules of the Libertarian Party.

Rule 6.2. The Rules Committee may, prior to the consideration of any other amendment, present a report that includes any recommended amendments to the Party Rules, including those submitted to the Secretary. This report may include any motion to adopt amendments recommended by the Rules Committee as a whole, as long as such amendments were distributed to the State Committee in accordance with the Rules of the Libertarian Party. Any motion to divide such motion shall be in order.

Rule 6.3. Subsequent amendments not recommended by the Rules Committee shall be presented by the Secretary as long as such amendments were received by the Secretary and distributed to the State Committee in accordance with the Rules of the Libertarian Party. The Secretary shall present such amendments in the order they were received, alternating between different authors, if such authors are proposing multiple amendments, in the order that the Secretary received them.

Rule 6.4. If discussion on an amendment has begun, any recognized speaker may also discuss alternative proposed amendments that deal with the same issues and may use that text to propose a substitution to the current amendment.

Rule 6.5. If a member of the State Committee proposes more than one amendment, their subsequent proposals shall be taken up only after every other member's first proposed amendment has been considered.

Exhibit 1 (page 3 of 5)

Rule 6.6. Debate on each amendment shall be limited to ten (10) minutes. Each speaker is limited to one (1) minute at a time. The Chair shall alternately recognize those speakers in favor of and opposed to the amendment.

Rule 7. ELECTIONS OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE.

Rule 7.1. **GENERAL.** All elections and filling of vacancies of the Executive Committee shall be conducted by election in accordance with Rule 7 of these Rules.

Rule 7.1.1. Nominations of all officers and Members-At-Large shall only be in order in accordance with the agenda.

Rule 7.1.2. **ELECTIONS BY ELECTRONIC MEANS.** All elections of the Executive Committee shall be conducted as a secret ballot using an electronic system that batches the ballots of in-person and teleconferencing participants together.

Rule 7.1.3. **NONE OF THE ABOVE (“NOTA”) AS A CANDIDATE.** All elections shall have NOTA as an option. On all elections for the Executive Committee, the choice of None of the Above (“NOTA”) is automatically recognized as included and valid. If NOTA receives a majority of the votes, there will be a new round of nominations and a new election, in which all of the nominated candidates who were outpolled by NOTA are ineligible.

Rule 7.2. **ELECTION OF OFFICERS.** Officers shall be elected individually in the following order: Chair, 1st Vice-Chair, 2nd Vice-Chair, Secretary, and Treasurer. In order to be elected to an officer position, the candidate must receive a majority of votes cast. If an insufficient number of candidates receive a majority on any given ballot, then the candidate with the lowest number of votes shall be removed from the ballot; a tie for smallest number of votes shall require a new ballot.

Rule 7.3. ELECTION OF MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE.

Rule 7.3.1. Members-At-Large of the Executive Committee shall be elected by majority vote in a single election. There shall be no more than one Member-At-Large elected from a Judicial District. Only the candidate with the highest number of votes from a Judicial District shall be elected.

Rule 7.3.2. If fewer than five candidates receive a number of votes equal to or greater than a majority of the number of ballots cast, another round of voting shall immediately occur. For any Judicial District where a candidate was successfully elected, all remaining candidates in that Judicial District shall be dropped. When no candidate receives a number of votes equal to or greater than a majority of the number of ballots cast, the candidate with the lowest number of votes of all the remaining candidates will be dropped.

Rule 7.3.3. Subsequently rounds of voting shall be conducted until five Members-At-Large of the Executive Committee have been elected by a number of votes equal to or greater than a majority of the number of ballots cast, in which each are from a different Judicial District.

Exhibit 1 (page 4 of 5)

Rule 8. **ELECTION OF THE JUDICIAL COMMITTEE.**

Rule 8.1. **ELECTION BY TWO-THIRDS VOTE.** Members of the Judicial Committee shall be elected by two-thirds (2/3) vote in a single election.

Rule 8.2. **NONE OF THE ABOVE (“NOTA”) AS A CANDIDATE.** All elections shall have NOTA as an option. On all elections for the Judicial Committee, the choice of None of the Above (“NOTA”) is automatically recognized as included and valid. If NOTA receives a majority of the votes, there will be a new round of nominations and a new election, in which all of the nominated candidates who were outpolled by NOTA are ineligible.

Rule 8.3. If fewer than nine candidates receive a number of votes equal to or greater than two-thirds (2/3) of the number of ballots cast, another round of voting shall immediately occur. When no candidate receives a number of votes equal to or greater than two-thirds (2/3) of the number of ballots cast, the candidate with the lowest number of votes of all the remaining candidates will be dropped.

Rule 8.4. Subsequently rounds of voting shall be conducted until nine (9) members of the Judicial Committee have been elected by a number of votes equal to or greater than two-thirds (2/3) of the number of ballots cast.

Rule 8.5. If fewer than nine (9) members of the Judicial Committee are elected in a single election, there shall be a new round of nominations and any candidate that was dropped in the previous elections held in accordance with Rule 8 shall be ineligible. If after a second election there are fewer than nine (9) members of the Judicial Committee, vacancies of the Judicial Committee shall be filled at the next meeting of the State Committee.

Rule 9. **CANDIDATE SPEECHES.**

Rule 9.1. Candidates for Chair shall each be allowed five minutes to speak; candidates for all other Party offices shall each be allowed three (3) minutes to speak. Candidates to fill vacancies on the State Committee shall be allowed one minute to speak. Candidates may cede their time only to other members of the State Committee to speak on their behalf during their allotted time. Speeches will not be allowed for uncontested positions, in which candidates are only running against NOTA.

Rule 9.2. Candidates seeking endorsement for the highest public office shall each be allowed five minutes to speak; candidates seeking endorsement for all other public offices shall each be allowed three minutes to speak; candidates seeking endorsement for any public office shall also each be allowed one nominating speech and one seconding speech of one minute each.

Rule 10. **ENDORSEMENTS OF CANDIDATES.** Endorsements of candidates for public office shall be made in the same manner as elections for Party office, except that endorsements shall require a two-thirds (2/3) majority. Each office shall be filled with one election, even if that office has more than a single position to be filled. Each election shall consist of a series of ballots. In each ballot, voters may vote for as many candidates as there are positions for the office still open or “None of the Above”. If None of the

Exhibit 1 (page 5 of 5)

Above achieves a majority, a new election shall be held for the open positions still remaining and the candidates who were outpolled by None of the Above shall be ineligible; otherwise, those who achieve the requisite majority shall be recognized as elected, in order of their vote totals and in order of the length of term. The candidate receiving the fewest votes shall be eliminated from succeeding ballots. Ties shall be resolved by a separate ballot.

Rule 11. **PLATFORM.** When discussing the Platform, the previously adopted Platform shall be the base on which amendments, additions, or deletions shall be offered. Such changes to the Platform shall require a vote in accordance with the Rules of the Libertarian Party.

Rule 12. **RESOLUTIONS.**

Rule 12.1. A resolution offered by an individual member shall be submitted by the maker and the seconder – each of whom shall be a member of the State Committee – and shall be sent by email directly to the Secretary.

Rule 12.2. The Resolutions Subcommittee may convene during the main meeting to consider resolutions. Each member who offers a resolution shall be given an opportunity to explain it to the Resolutions Subcommittee if he so requests.

Rule 12.3. The Resolutions Subcommittee shall review all resolutions in the order they were submitted, and shall amend the text of each resolution to the satisfaction of the member that submitted the resolution, while satisfying formatting requirements, grammar, clarity, etc. The Resolutions Subcommittee shall present a report to the State Committee of all resolutions in the order they deem appropriate.

Rule 13. **PERMANENT RECORD.** All reports and other material for the permanent record or printed proceedings shall be typewritten and, immediately on presentation, shall be sent to the Recording Secretary in electronic form.

Rule 14. **ANNOUNCEMENTS.** Notices for announcement to the convention shall be in writing, signed by the person (or a proper representative of the persons) under whose authority the announcement is issued, and shall be sent to the desk of the Recording Secretary.

Rule 15. **SUSPENSION OF SPECIAL RULES OF ORDER.** These Special Rules of Order may only be suspended by a two-thirds (2/3) vote.

Exhibit 2 (page 1 of 3)

Credentials and Nominations Report of the Libertarian Party of New York for the State Committee Meeting of January 31, 2021

The State Committee of the Libertarian Party of New York consists of 68 according to their Judicial District. The following 67 individuals were duly elected or appointed to fill a vacancy on the State Committee of the Libertarian Party of New York:

Judicial District 1

- Mark N. Axinn
- Ilya Schwartzburg
- *VACANT*
- *VACANT*

Judicial District 2

- Gilbert L. Midonnet
- Matthew I. Morgan
- Gary S. Popkin
- Stacey H. Prussman

Judicial District 3

- William Cody Anderson
- Jay A. Carr
- Todd G. Haggerty
- Lora L. Newell

Judicial District 4

- Robert M. Arrigo
- Nathan B. Dunn
- John A. Janes
- Brandon Lyon
- Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson
- Zachary Daniel Remian

Judicial District 5

- Rachel E. Becker
- Milva E. Dordal
- David E. Fite
- Shawn Hannon
- Craig A. Miles
- Sean S. Stevens

Judicial District 6

- Mark S. Braiman
- Timothy M. O'Connor
- Christopher M. Olenski
- Richard F. Purtell
- Thomas D. Quiter
- Paul C. Sechrist

Judicial District 7

- Steven G. Becker
- Kari R. Bittner
- Eric A. Cooper
- Anthony D'Orazio
- James M. Dayton
- Mark E. Glogowski
- Andrew C. Hollister
- Sean C. Phelan
- James P. Russell
- Kevin A. Wilson

Judicial District 8

- Erin M. Becker
- Francis Law
- Kathleen M. Ligammari
- Andrew M. Kolstee
- Peyton D. Kunselman
- F. Patrick Mahoney, Jr.
- Leonard E. Morlock
- Tara L. Scrivano
- Duane J. Whitmer

Judicial District 9

- Daniel P. Donnelly
- Pietro S. Geraci
- Robert J. Greibesland
- Anthony W. Pellegrino
- William K. Schmidt

Judicial District 10

- Deepak Bansal
- Gary L. Donoyan
- Kenneth Epstein
- Carmen Horan
- Bobby K. Kalotee
- Satinder Kaur
- Mahavir Singh

Judicial District 11

- Michael A. Arcati
- Gabrielle S. Cordova
- Irwin Mark Weinblatt

Judicial District 12

- Aaron A. Commey
- Enmanuel H. Torres

Judicial District 13

- Richard Bell
- Susan B. Overeem Cummings

Ex-Officio

- Paul Grindle

There are currently two (2) vacancies on the State Committee: two (2) in Judicial District 1.

Exhibit 2 (page 2 of 3)

NOMINATIONS FOR JUDICIAL DISTRICT VACANCIES (2 VACANCIES)

The following names were submitted to the Secretary as candidates to fill the vacancies on the State Committee:

Judicial District 1 (2 vacancies)

- *No nominations yet.*

NOMINATIONS FOR JUDICIAL COMMITTEE (9 POSITIONS AVAILABLE)

The following names were submitted to the Secretary as candidates to fill the nine (9) positions on the Judicial Committee and accepted their nomination prior or during the January 23, 2021 portion of the meeting and their names were entered into nomination. Some candidates have since withdrawn from the election.

- **Steven G. Becker, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- *Mark S. Braiman, nominated by Timothy O'Connor (withdrew January 27, 2021)*
- **James Dayton, nominated by Lora L. Newell**
- **Milva E. Dordal, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- **David E. Fite, nominated by Pietro S. Geraci**
- **Shawn Hannon, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- **Melvin H. Foster, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- **Peyton D. Kunselman, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- **Francis Law, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- *Thomas D. Quiter, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer (withdrew January 26, 2021)*
- **William Schmidt, nominated by Lora L. Newell**
- **Chase D. Tkach, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- **Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson, nominated by Duane J. Whitmer**
- **Christian J. Vondras, nominated by Pietro S. Geraci**
- **Kevin Wilson, nominated by Andrew M. Kolstee**

Exhibit 2 (page 3 of 3)

Statements from Nominated Candidates

Melvin Foster – Candidate for Judicial Committee

Constitution Chat. In 2011 I was growing increasingly concerned about polarization and people's lack of understanding of the opposing point of view, particularly on the competing property issues involved in fracking, but a number of other issues as well. I saw that people were dividing tribally into camps. To try to create dialogue, in January of 2012 I began a monthly meeting in Candor and a weekly column in the local paper The Broader View. I called both "Constitution Chat." Over the course of a year we worked our way through the Bill of Rights talking about the meaning of the amendments and how disputes about them were playing out in current news stories. I also had the chance to hear Ron Paul at Cornell.

Libertarian Party. In December of 2015 I grew so disgusted with the presidential candidates being offered that I connected with Rich Purtell and we began meeting with others to discuss libertarian ideas and organize a Tioga county chapter of the Libertarian Party, which we successfully did April 25, 2017. March 20, 2018 I became the county chair, and led a successful ICO meeting June 8 2019. I assisted in filing a number of petitions to become a CC, but we fell short of the needed level. I stepped down from the Tioga chair position to vice chair last month. I have attended several state conventions and assisted with petitioning over the years.

Other Personal Details

In the work world I have been a high school teacher and homeschool instructor and parent, including teaching government and economics classes in both settings.
I am also a pastor, husband, and father of five kids.

Francis Law – Candidate for Judicial Committee

It is with pleasure that I accept the nomination to be considered for service on the New York Libertarian State Judicial Committee.

While I believe I have always been a libertarian, I formally registered to vote as a Libertarian sometime in the early to mid-1980's.

For over three decades, I have studied libertarian philosophy and have held dearly to the tenants of its positions.

I have directly participated in county organizations and have had some involvement in state level activities, while always advocating and promoting the Libertarian Party to the public. Recently, I was honored to be elected to the State Committee, representing Judicial District 8.

If elected, I will bring a well-seasoned background in libertarian matters, a determined fairness in examining the issues, and solid principles to the State Judicial Committee.
I am thankful for the opportunity to be considered for this position.

Andrew M. Kolstee
Secretary

Exhibit 3 (page 1 of 5)

REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK ON THE REQUEST FOR A HEARING FOR REVOCATION OF THE AFFILIATION OF NIAGARA COUNTY ORGANIZATION

SUMMARY

The Executive Committee voted on December 22, 2020 to request a hearing be held by the State Committee in order to revoke the affiliation of the County Organization in Niagara County, due to the abandonment of all officer positions.

The County Organization in Niagara County was affiliated with the Libertarian Party of New York at the May 5, 2019 meeting of the Interim State Committee. The County Affiliate had a total of five officers prior to April 14, 2020: Charles Flynn (Chair), Nicholas Phelps (1st Vice Chair), Francis Law (2nd Vice Chair), Kathleen Ligammari (Secretary), and Bryan Owczarzak (Treasurer).

Francis Law resigned from his position on April 14, 2020. Charles Flynn and Kathleen Ligammari were removed from their positions by the Interim State Committee on August 2, 2020. As a result, Nicholas Phelps became Chair and vacated the 1st Vice Chair position. In September 2020, Bryan Owczarzak resigned as Treasurer. On December 8, 2020, Nicholas Phelps resigned as Chair.

As a result, all officer positions of the County Organization in Niagara County are vacant. Per the rules of the County Affiliate, only the Chair can call a meeting. Since a meeting to fill the vacancies in the officer positions cannot be held, revoking the affiliate's status would allow another group of Libertarians to rebuild the affiliate.

MOTION

Motion to **approve a hearing to be held by the State Committee in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to revoke the affiliation of the County Organization in Niagara County.**

Exhibit 3 (page 2 of 5)

REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK ON THE REQUEST FOR A HEARING FOR THE REMOVAL OF KATHLEEN LIGAMMARI AS A MEMBER OF THE STATE COMMITTEE FROM JUDICIAL DISTRICT 8

SUMMARY

The Executive Committee voted on December 22, 2020 to request a hearing to be held by the State Committee in order to remove Kathleen Ligammari as a member of the State Committee from Judicial District 8.

On March 21, 2020, Charles Flynn, posing as the presiding officer of the Libertarian Party of New York and Kathleen Ligammari, posing as the secretary of the Libertarian Party of New York, filed certificates of authorizations for the following candidates at the Niagara County Board of Elections:

- Brian D. Seamon (Niagara County District Attorney)
- Michael J. Filicetti (Niagara County Sheriff)
- Jeffrey M. Dewart (Town of Somerset Supervisor)
- Frederick W. Leuer (Town of Somerset Council)

Also on March 21, 2020, Charles Flynn and Kathleen Ligammari, posing as the presiding officer of the Libertarian Party of New York and Kathleen Ligammari, posing as the secretary of the Libertarian Party of New York, filed certificates of authorizations for the following candidates at the New York State Board of Elections:

- Michael J. Norris (Assembly District 144)
- Angelo J. Morinello (Assembly District 145)
- Robert G. Ortt (Senate District 62)

These seven (7) candidates, none of which were enrolled members of the Libertarian Party, required a certificate of authorization to be signed and filed by the Chair of the Libertarian Party (James Rosenbeck) and Secretary of the Libertarian Party (Frederick Cole). On March 19, 2020, the Interim State Committee declined to issue certificates of authorizations for the said seven (7) candidates. Despite this, Charles Flynn and Kathleen Ligammari filed fraudulent certificates of authorization for the seven (7) candidates.

Exhibit 3 (page 3 of 5)

As a result, on July 5, 2020, the Interim State Committee voted to hold a hearing for the purpose of removing Charles Flynn and Kathleen Ligammari as Chair and Secretary respectively of the County Organization in Niagara County. Both were notified of the hearing to be held on July 19, 2020. Flynn and Ligammari both failed to appear at the hearing and so a rescheduled hearing was held on July 26, 2020, in which both were once again notified. At this second date, Flynn and Ligammari again failed to appear at the hearing. The hearing was rescheduled to a third date, August 2, 2020 and Flynn and Ligammari were notified.

Flynn and Ligammari failed to appear at the August 2, 2020 hearing date. The hearing was held and as a result, Charles Flynn and Kathleen Ligammari were removed as Chair and Secretary respectively of the County Organization in Niagara County. Additionally, both Flynn and Ligammari were banned from holding a leadership position in the Libertarian Party of New York on the state or county level for a period of ten (10) years.

On September 18, 2020, Scott P. Flynn and Kathleen M. Ligammari filed a set of rules of a purported Niagara County Libertarian Party at the Niagara County Board of Elections. The document provided the following members of their Executive Committee:

- Scott P. Flynn, Chairman
- Tara Scrivano, Vice-Chair
- Kathleen Ligammari, Secretary
- Charles Flynn, Treasurer
- Norman Baker, Member
- Nicholas P. Phelps, Jr., Member
- Joshua Hojnowski, Member

This purported Niagara County Libertarian Party was not the authorized affiliate of the Libertarian Party. At the time, the authorized affiliate was chaired by Nicholas Phelps. Additionally, Ligammari, who was banned from holding any leadership position in the Libertarian Party for ten (10) years not only claimed to be Secretary of the purported committee, but she signed her name to the fraudulent documents along with Scott Flynn.

MOTION

Motion to **approve a hearing to be held by the State Committee in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to remove Kathleen Ligammari as a Member of the State Committee from Judicial District 8 on the charges of filing fraudulent rules of a purported County Affiliate in Niagara County at the Niagara County Board of Elections.**

Exhibit 3 (page 4 of 5)

REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK ON THE REQUEST FOR A HEARING FOR THE REMOVAL OF KENNETH EPSTEIN, CARMEN HORAN, BOBBY KALOTEE, AND MAHAVIR SINGH AS MEMBERS OF THE STATE COMMITTEE FROM JUDICIAL DISTRICT 10

SUMMARY

The Executive Committee voted on December 22, 2020 to request a hearing to be held by the State Committee in order to remove Kenneth Epstein, Carmen Horan, Bobby Kalotee, and Mahavir Singh as members of the State Committee from Judicial District 10.

On March 24, 2020, Kenneth Epstein, posing as the “Chairman” of the purported Nassau County Interim County Organization, filed a list of officers and a set of county rules with the Nassau County Board of Elections of a purported Nassau County Interim County Organization. Bobby Kalotee was named “Chairman Emeritus” and Carmen Horan was named “Vice Chairman.”

On March 24, 2020, Mahavir Singh, posing as the “Chairman” of the purported Suffolk County Interim County Organization, filed a list of officers and a set of county rules with the Suffolk County Board of Elections of a purported Suffolk County Interim County Organization.

Kenneth Epstein, posing as the “Chairman” of the purported Nassau County Interim County Organization and Mahavir Singh, posing as the “Chairman” of the purported Suffolk County Interim County Organization, filed certificates of authorization for the following candidates at the New York State Board of Elections:

- Andrew R. Garbarino, Congressional District 2
- Douglas L. Tuman, Congressional District 4
- Edmund J. Smyth, State Senate District 5
- Dennis Dunne, Sr., State Senate District 6
- Nicholas J. LaLota, State Senate District 8
- Joseph P. Addabbo, Jr., State Senate District 15
- Michael A. Durso, State Assembly District 9
- Charles D. Lavine, State Assembly District 13
- David G. McDonough, State Assembly District 14
- Michael A. Montesano, State Assembly District 15
- John K. Mikulin, State Assembly District 17
- Edward P. Ra, State Assembly District 19
- Melissa L. Miller, State Assembly District 20

Exhibit 3 (page 5 of 5)

These fourteen (14) candidates, none of which were enrolled members of the Libertarian Party, required a certificate of authorization to be signed and filed by the Chair of the Libertarian Party (James Rosenbeck) and Secretary of the Libertarian Party (Frederick Cole). Despite this, Kenneth Epstein and Mahavir Singh filed fraudulent certificates of authorization for the fourteen (14) candidates.

Additionally, the purported Suffolk and Nassau Interim County Organizations aforementioned are not the recognized affiliates of the Libertarian Party of New York. The authorized County Affiliates in Suffolk and Nassau Counties did not request the authorizations of the aforementioned candidates, with the sole exception of Edmund J. Smyth. All of the candidates, none of whom are enrolled members of the Libertarian Party, were also not authorized by the Interim State Committee to appear on the Libertarian Party line, with Edmund J. Smyth explicitly rejected by the Interim State Committee.

MOTION

Motion to approve a hearing to be held by the State Committee in accordance with Article 11 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party in order to remove Kenneth Epstein, Carmen Horan, Bobby Kalotee, and Mahavir Singh as Members of the State Committee from Judicial District 10 on the charges of filing fraudulent certificates of authorization for fourteen (14) candidates at the New York State Board of Elections, and filing fraudulent rules of purported County Affiliates in Nassau and Suffolk Counties at the Nassau and Suffolk County Board of Elections.

Report prepared by Andrew M. Kolstee, Secretary.

Report of the Executive Committee of the Libertarian Party of New York – January 23, 2021 – Page 5