

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES  
LIBERTARIAN NATIONAL COMMITTEE  
January 17, 2022  
VIA ZOOM



CURRENT STATUS:

**FINAL.REV1**

PREPARED BY **CARYN ANN HARLOS**, LNC SECRETARY

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>OPENING CEREMONY</b>   | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>CALL TO ORDER</b>  | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>HOUSEKEEPING</b>   | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>ATTENDANCE</b>   | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>PUBLIC COMMENT</b>   | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>MEETING PURPOSE</b>  | <b>6</b>  |
| <b>NEW BUSINESS WITH PREVIOUS NOTICE</b>                              | <b>6</b>  |
| <b>CENSURE OF AT-LARGE REPRESENTATIVE JOSHUA SMITH</b>                | <b>6</b>  |
| <b>EXECUTIVE SESSION</b>  | <b>7</b>  |
| <b>NEW BUSINESS WITH PREVIOUS NOTICE (CONT'D)</b>                     | <b>7</b>  |
| <b>CENSURE OF AT-LARGE REPRESENTATIVE JOSHUA SMITH (CONT'D)</b>       | <b>7</b>  |
| <b>VOTE ON MOTION TO CENSURE AT-LARGE REPRESENTATIVE JOSHUA SMITH</b> | <b>11</b> |
| <b>ADJOURNMENT</b>  | <b>12</b> |
| <b>TABLE OF NUMBERED MOTIONS</b>                                      | <b>12</b> |

**LEGEND:** text to be inserted, ~~text to be deleted~~, unchanged existing text, *substantive final main motions*.

All main substantive motions will be set off by *bold and italics in green font* (with related subsidiary and incidental motions *set off by highlighted italics*) and will be assigned a motion number comprising the date and a sequential number to be recorded in the Secretary-in-Exile's Main Motion/Ballot Tally record located at <https://tinyurl.com/lncvotes2022>

Points of Order and substantive objections will be indicated in **BOLD RED TEXT**.

All vote results, challenges, and rulings will be set off by **BOLD ITALICS**.

The LPedia article for this meeting can be found at: [https://lpedia.org/wiki/LNC Meeting 17 January 2022](https://lpedia.org/wiki/LNC_Meeting_17_January_2022)

Recordings for this meeting can be found at the LPedia link.

## OPENING CEREMONY

### CALL TO ORDER

Chair Whitney Bilyeu called the meeting to order at 8:00 p.m. (all times Eastern)

## HOUSEKEEPING

### ATTENDANCE

The following were in attendance as per the roll call of the Secretary:<sup>1</sup>

**Officers:** Whitney Bilyeu (Chair), Ken Moellman (Vice-Chair), Tim Hagan (Treasurer), John Wilford (Secretary)

**At-Large Representatives:** Laura Ebke, Richard Longstreth, Erik Raudsep, Valerie Sarwark, Joshua Smith

**Regional Representatives:** Chris Luchini (Region 1), Steven Nekhaila (Region 2), Dustin Nanna (Region 3), Jeff Hewitt (Region 4), Susan Hogarth (Region 5), John Phillips (Region 6), Erin Adams (Region 7), Rich Bowen (Region 8)

**Regional Alternates:** Alex Flores (Region 1), Jared Hall (Region 3), Tim Ferreira (Region 4), Otto Dassing (Region 5), Matthew Bughman (Region 6), Beth Vest (Region 7), Pat Ford (Region 8)

**Absent:** David Sexton (Region 2 Alternate)

**Staff:** Tyler Harris (Executive Director)

**Others:** Richard Brown (Parliamentarian)

There were numerous members of the gallery present.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

**WITHOUT OBJECTION, Mr. Smith moved to extend public comment to thirty (30) minutes.**

**WITHOUT OBJECTION, Ms. Hogarth moved to limit speaking time to one (1) minute per person.**

Public comment was made by the following persons:

---

<sup>1</sup> Mr. Dassing and Mr. Raudsep joined the meeting after the initial call of the roll.

- David Benner (TN)
- David Brady (MN)
- Ryan Brown (NC)
- Justin Carmen (NY)
- Pietro Geraci (NY)
- Caryn Ann Harlos (CO)
- Daniel Lutz (CO)
- Carol Moore (DE)
- Nolan Pelletier (NH)
- Daryl Perry (NH)
- Derek Ruthman (sp?) (state unknown)
- Bill Schultz (KY)
- Loren Springer (CA)
- Nicholas (last name not given, state unknown)

**Mr. Smith moved to turn on the Zoom chat.**

A roll call vote was conducted with the following results:

| <b>Member / Alternate</b> | <b>Aye</b> | <b>No</b> | <b>Abstain</b> |
|---------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|
| Adams                     |            | X         |                |
| Bilyeu                    |            |           | X              |
| Bowen                     | X          |           |                |
| Ebke                      |            | X         |                |
| Hagan                     | X          |           |                |
| Hewitt                    | X          |           |                |
| Hogarth                   | X          |           |                |
| Longstreth                | X          |           |                |
| Luchini                   |            | X         |                |
| Moellman                  | X          |           |                |
| Nanna                     | X          |           |                |
| Nekhaila                  | X          |           |                |
| Phillips                  |            |           | X              |
| Raudsep                   | X          |           |                |
| Sarwark                   |            | X         |                |
| Smith                     | X          |           |                |
| Wilford                   |            |           | X              |
| <b>TOTALS</b>             | <b>10</b>  | <b>4</b>  | <b>3</b>       |

**This motion PASSED with a roll call vote of 10-4-3.**

## MEETING PURPOSE

The meeting was called to consider a motion of censure against At-Large Representative Joshua Smith.

## NEW BUSINESS WITH PREVIOUS NOTICE

### CENSURE OF AT-LARGE REPRESENTATIVE JOSHUA SMITH



*On behalf of the EPCC, Mr. Longstreth moved the following:*

*WHEREAS, In July 2020 At-Large Representative Joshua Smith received the privilege and honor of being re-elected to represent the National Libertarian Party as an At-Large Representative to the Libertarian National Committee, and;*

*WHEREAS, All staff and representatives elected to the Libertarian National Committee (LNC) are expected to adhere to the rules governing the LNC as outlined in the Libertarian National Committee Policy Manual, and;*

*WHEREAS, The LNC Policy Manual at 2.01.6.11 outlines the procedure for handling concerns regarding staff in a professional way and was approved by the currently sitting LNC in June 2021 unanimously, and;*

*WHEREAS, Joshua Smith wrote an email to the LNC Business List on 12/24/2021 in which he publicly expressed concerns regarding a staff member and demanded their termination publicly prior to bringing the matter before the EPCC, Executive Committee, or the Chair and Vice Chair.*

*NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Joshua Smith is hereby censured for violating the Libertarian National Committee Policy Manual at 2.01.6.11 by publicly demanding a staff member be terminated via email. [20220117-01]*

*Mr. Smith moved to postpone indefinitely which **DIED** for lack of a second.*

*Mr. Luchini moved to enter into Executive Session with Mr. Harris present.*

A roll call vote was conducted with the following results:

| Member / Alternate | Aye | No | Abstain |
|--------------------|-----|----|---------|
| Adams              | X   |    |         |
| Bilyeu             |     |    | X       |
| Bowen              |     | X  |         |
| Ebke               | X   |    |         |
| Hagan              | X   |    |         |
| Hewitt             | X   |    |         |

| Member / Alternate | Aye       | No       | Abstain  |
|--------------------|-----------|----------|----------|
| Hogarth            | X         |          |          |
| Longstreth         |           | X        |          |
| Luchini            | X         |          |          |
| Moellman           | X         |          |          |
| Nanna              |           | X        |          |
| Nekhaila           | X         |          |          |
| Phillips           |           | X        |          |
| Raudsep            | X         |          |          |
| Sarwark            | X         |          |          |
| Smith              |           | X        |          |
| Wilford            | X         |          |          |
| <b>TOTALS</b>      | <b>11</b> | <b>5</b> | <b>1</b> |

*This motion PASSED with a roll call vote of 11-5-1.*

**EXECUTIVE SESSION**

The LNC entered into Executive Session at 9:07 p.m. and arose from Executive Session at 10:19 p.m.

**NEW BUSINESS WITH PREVIOUS NOTICE (CONT'D)**

**CENSURE OF AT-LARGE REPRESENTATIVE JOSHUA SMITH (cont'd)**



A fresh roll call was requested. There were no new attendees. The only additional absence was Alex Flores (Region 1 Alternate) though he re-entered the meeting at some point later.

Mr. Phillips announced that he needed to depart the meeting, and Mr. Bughman would be voting in his stead.

*Ms. Adams moved to postpone for thirty (30) days until February 16, 2022, at 8pm Eastern.<sup>2</sup>*

*Mr. Smith moved to end debate.*

A roll call vote was conducted on the motion to end debate with the following results:

| Member / Alternate | Aye | No | Abstain |
|--------------------|-----|----|---------|
| Adams              | X   |    |         |
| Bilyeu             |     |    | X       |
| Bowen              | X   |    |         |

<sup>2</sup> There was confusion during this part of the meeting with a motion to postpone indefinitely made by Ms. Adams which was seconded which was never formally withdrawn but seems to have been implicitly withdrawn without objection. The Party Parliamentarian Richard Brown was consulted to answer questions about these types of motions and the effects thereof.

| <b>Member / Alternate</b> | <b>Aye</b> | <b>No</b> | <b>Abstain</b> |
|---------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|
| Ebke                      | X          |           |                |
| Hagan                     | X          |           |                |
| Hewitt                    | X          |           |                |
| Hogarth                   | X          |           |                |
| Longstreth                | X          |           |                |
| Luchini                   |            | X         |                |
| Moellman                  | X          |           |                |
| Nanna                     | X          |           |                |
| Nekhaila                  | X          |           |                |
| Phillips/Bughman          | X          |           |                |
| Raudsep                   | X          |           |                |
| Sarwark                   |            | X         |                |
| Smith                     | X          |           |                |
| Wilford                   | X          |           |                |
| <b>TOTALS</b>             | <b>14</b>  | <b>2</b>  | <b>1</b>       |

*This motion PASSED with a roll call vote of 14-2-1.*

A roll call vote was conducted on the motion to postpone with the following results:

| <b>Member / Alternate</b> | <b>Aye</b> | <b>No</b> | <b>Abstain</b> |
|---------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|
| Adams                     | X          |           |                |
| Bilyeu                    |            | X         |                |
| Bowen                     | X          |           |                |
| Ebke                      | X          |           |                |
| Hagan                     |            | X         |                |
| Hewitt                    |            | X         |                |
| Hogarth                   |            | X         |                |
| Longstreth                |            | X         |                |
| Luchini                   |            | X         |                |
| Moellman                  |            | X         |                |
| Nanna                     | X          |           |                |
| Nekhaila                  | X          |           |                |
| Phillips/Bughman          |            | X         |                |
| Raudsep                   | X          |           |                |
| Sarwark                   |            | X         |                |
| Smith                     | X          |           |                |
| Wilford                   | X          |           |                |
| <b>TOTALS</b>             | <b>8</b>   | <b>9</b>  | <b>0</b>       |

*This motion FAILED with a roll call vote of 8-9-0.*



*Mr. Moellman moved to postpone for fourteen (14) days until January 31, 2022, at 8pm Eastern.*

*Mr. Wilford moved to amend to postpone indefinitely.*

Mr. Longstreth made a **POINT OF ORDER** that the Wilford amendment is an improper attempt to turn the original motion into an entirely different motion.

Mr. Wilford's motion was ruled **OUT OF ORDER** with the Chair stating the rationale as being the motion to postpone indefinitely is of a lower rank than the original motion and cannot be substituted for that motion.

**WITHOUT OBJECTION**, Mr. Luchini called the question.

A roll call vote was conducted on the motion to postpone with the following results:

| Member / Alternate | Aye      | No       | Abstain  |
|--------------------|----------|----------|----------|
| Adams              | X        |          |          |
| Bilyeu             |          |          | X        |
| Bowen              | X        |          |          |
| Ebke               |          | X        |          |
| Hagan              |          | X        |          |
| Hewitt             |          | X        |          |
| Hogarth            |          | X        |          |
| Longstreth         |          | X        |          |
| Luchini            |          | X        |          |
| Moellman           | X        |          |          |
| Nanna              | X        |          |          |
| Nekhaila           | X        |          |          |
| Phillips/Bughman   |          | X        |          |
| Raudsep            | X        |          |          |
| Sarwark            |          | X        |          |
| Smith              |          |          | X        |
| Wilford            |          | X        |          |
| <b>TOTALS</b>      | <b>6</b> | <b>9</b> | <b>2</b> |

***This motion FAILED with a roll call vote of 6-9-2.***

*Mr. Luchini moved to end debate on the main motion.*

In response to a request by Mr. Smith that a motion be made and passed to censure the rest of the LNC for their handling of the Caryn Ann Harlos suspension motion which violated the exact same Policy Manual section that he is accused of violating in exchange for his acceptance of this censure, Ms. Bilyeu ruled that additional motions not specifically noticed

for this special meeting were **OUT OF ORDER**. Mr. Smith **APEALED** from the ruling of the Chair stating that he did in fact give notice of his intent to move such a censure.

Ms. Adams informed the LNC that she needed to step away temporarily and Ms. Vest would be voting in her stead.

A roll call vote was conducted on the appeal with the following results:

| <b>Member / Alternate</b> | <b>Aye</b> | <b>No</b> | <b>Abstain</b> |
|---------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|
| Adams/Vest                | X          |           |                |
| Bilyeu                    |            |           | X              |
| Bowen                     |            | X         |                |
| Ebke                      | X          |           |                |
| Hagan                     | X          |           |                |
| Hewitt                    | X          |           |                |
| Hogarth                   | X          |           |                |
| Longstreth                | X          |           |                |
| Luchini                   | X          |           |                |
| Moellman                  | X          |           |                |
| Nanna                     | X          |           |                |
| Nekhaila                  |            |           | X              |
| Phillips/Bughman          | X          |           |                |
| Raudsep                   | X          |           |                |
| Sarwark                   | X          |           |                |
| Smith                     |            | X         |                |
| Wilford                   | X          |           |                |
| <b>TOTALS</b>             | <b>13</b>  | <b>2</b>  | <b>2</b>       |

This ruling of the Chair was **UPHELD** with a roll call vote of 13-2-2.

A roll call vote was conducted on ending debate with the following results:

| <b>Member / Alternate</b> | <b>Aye</b> | <b>No</b> | <b>Abstain</b> |
|---------------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|
| Adams/Vest                | X          |           |                |
| Bilyeu                    |            |           | X              |
| Bowen                     | X          |           |                |
| Ebke                      | X          |           |                |
| Hagan                     | X          |           |                |
| Hewitt                    | X          |           |                |
| Hogarth                   | X          |           |                |
| Longstreth                | X          |           |                |
| Luchini                   | X          |           |                |
| Moellman                  |            | X         |                |
| Nanna                     | X          |           |                |

| Member / Alternate | Aye       | No       | Abstain  |
|--------------------|-----------|----------|----------|
| Nekhaila           | X         |          |          |
| Phillips/Bughman   | X         |          |          |
| Raudsep            | X         |          |          |
| Sarwark            | X         |          |          |
| Smith              | X         |          |          |
| Wilford            | X         |          |          |
| <b>TOTALS</b>      | <b>15</b> | <b>1</b> | <b>1</b> |

*This motion PASSED with a roll call vote of 15-1-1.*

### Vote on Motion to Censure At-Large Representative Joshua Smith

The motion before the body as earlier moved by Mr. Longstreth read as follows:

*WHEREAS, In July 2020 At-Large Representative Joshua Smith received the privilege and honor of being re-elected to represent the National Libertarian Party as an At-Large Representative to the Libertarian National Committee, and;*

*WHEREAS, All staff and representatives elected to the Libertarian National Committee (LNC) are expected to adhere to the rules governing the LNC as outlined in the Libertarian National Committee Policy Manual, and;*

*WHEREAS, The LNC Policy Manual at 2.01.6.11 outlines the procedure for handling concerns regarding staff in a professional way and was approved by the currently sitting LNC in June 2021 unanimously, and;*

*WHEREAS, Joshua Smith wrote an email to the LNC Business List on 12/24/2021 in which he publicly expressed concerns regarding a staff member and demanded their termination publicly prior to bringing the matter before the EPCC, Executive Committee, or the Chair and Vice Chair.*

*NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Joshua Smith is hereby censured for violating the Libertarian National Committee Policy Manual at 2.01.6.11 by publicly demanding a staff member be terminated via email. [20220117-01]*

A roll call vote was conducted on the motion to censure with the following results:

| Member / Alternate | Aye | No | Abstain |
|--------------------|-----|----|---------|
| Adams/Vest         | X   |    |         |
| Bilyeu             |     |    | X       |
| Bowen              |     |    | X       |
| Ebke               | X   |    |         |
| Hagan              | X   |    |         |
| Hewitt             | X   |    |         |



| Member / Alternate | Aye       | No       | Abstain  |
|--------------------|-----------|----------|----------|
| Hogarth            | X         |          |          |
| Longstreth         | X         |          |          |
| Luchini            | X         |          |          |
| Moellman           |           | X        |          |
| Nanna              |           |          | X        |
| Nekhaila           |           | X        |          |
| Phillips/Bughman   | X         |          |          |
| Raudsep            |           | X        |          |
| Sarwark            | X         |          |          |
| Smith              |           | X        |          |
| Wilford            | X         |          |          |
| <b>TOTALS</b>      | <b>10</b> | <b>4</b> | <b>3</b> |

**This motion PASSED with a roll call vote of 10-4-3. [20220117-01]**

### ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned **WITHOUT OBJECTION** upon motion of Ms. Hogarth at 11:16 p.m.

### TABLE OF NUMBERED MOTIONS

\*Note that the master log of motions in 2022 can be found here: <https://tinyurl.com/Incvotes2022>

| ID#         | Motion/Ballot                  | Result |
|-------------|--------------------------------|--------|
| 20220117-01 | Motion to Censure Joshua Smith | PASSED |

Respectfully submitted,

