

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE COMMITTEE
OF THE LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON MONDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2023
ON THE ZOOM MEETING APP AND PORCUPINE APP**

MEMBERS PRESENT (41)

Richard F. Purtell (*ex officio*)
Mark N. Axinn (JD1)
Gary S. Popkin (JD2)
William Cody Anderson (JD3)
Justin N. Carman (JD3)
Jennifer L. O'Connor (JD3)
Lora Newell (JD3)
John A. Janes (JD4)
Zachary D. Remian (JD4)
Karen A. Keniry-Thompson (JD4)
Daniel J. Castello (JD5)
Shawn C. DeGrand (JD5)
Matthew K. Guilianelli (JD5)
Erinn Rose Leatherman (JD5)
Adam M. Magoon (JD5)
Keith C. Redhead (JD5)
Craig L. Shute (JD5)
Mark S. Braiman (JD6)
Christopher M. Olenski (JD6)
David S. Penner (JD6)
Craig L. Colwell (JD6)
Steven G. Becker (JD7)
Mark E. Glogowski (JD7)
Sean C. Phelan (JD7)

Marc A. Smith (JD7)
James M. Ziobro (JD7)
Maura E. Botsford (JD8)
Andrew M. Kolstee (JD8)
Frances Law (JD8)
Leonard E. Morlock (JD8)
Michael R. Rebmann (JD8)
Charles R. Roggen (JD8)
Jame J. VanDewalker (JD8)
Duane Whitmer (JD8)
Daniel P. Donnelly (JD9)
William K. Schmidt (JD9)
Jeffrey J. Denecke (JD10)
Jonathan H. Gunther (JD10)
Blay Tarnoff (JD10)
John Clifton (JD11)
Irwin Mark Weinblatt (JD11)

Amanda H. Ellithorpe (JD4)
Stephen C. Healey (JD3)
Brian L. Wells (JD4)
Jeffrey C. Bradley (JD7)
Erin M. Becker (JD8)
Juan R. Ayala (JD9)
Robert J. Cocomello (JD9)
Robert J. Greibesland (JD9)
Christian J. Vondras (JD9)
George T. Ostrowski (JD10)
Robert E. Schuon (JD10)
Randyn Tarnoff (JD10)
Francisco Olvera (JD11)

OBSERVERS

T.J. Ferreira, Porcupine Administrator

KEY

(1) Present at first roll call at 7:03 p.m.
(2) Present at second roll call.
(V) Filled vacancy during meeting.
(E) 2nd Vice Chair; *ex-officio* voting member.

MEMBERS ABSENT (17)

Morry C. Davis (JD1)
David B. Haywood (JD1)
Paul M. Grindle (JD2)
Matthew I. Morgan (JD2)

The meeting was called to order at 7:06 p.m. by Andrew Kolstee, Chair. Secretary Mark Braiman conducted a roll call and determined that a quorum was present.

A request for public comment by Chair Andrew Kolstee received no comments.

The Credentials and Nominations Report (**Exhibit 1**) indicated that there were thirty-one (31) of fifty-eight (58) voting members of the State Committee present at the time of roll call. Four (4) later entered the meeting, to give thirty-five (35) members present out of fifty-eight (58) members of the State Committee after the filling of vacancies. The Secretary determined that a quorum was present at all times during the meeting.

The **Agenda (Exhibit 2)** was adopted without objection

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of one (1) State Committee vacancy from Judicial District 5. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling this vacancy until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of two (2) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 6. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair

Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling these vacancies until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of three (3) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 7. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that Justin Pelletier had been nominated in advance.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of two (2) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 10. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling these vacancies until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of two (2) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 12. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling these vacancies until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of one (1) State Committee vacancy from Judicial District 13. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling this vacancy until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Treasurer William Cody Anderson issued a Treasurer's Report in writing (**Exhibit 3**) and the report **was accepted** without objection.

Field Development Director Andrew Kolstee issued a report regarding the level of progress by County Affiliates on meeting criteria required for recertification. **Motion by Justin Carman to certify that the County Affiliate in Wayne County has met the criteria required in Article 11.2.3. of the Rules of the Libertarian Party of New York** was seconded by Sean Phelan and passed without objection.

A hearing on revocation of the affiliation of Albany County was held. Motion by Mark Braiman to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Albany County until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** was seconded by Richard Purtell and debated. Mark Braiman stated his reason for proposing the adjournment was that Andrew Kolstee reported Albany County had attempted to hold its convention on March 14, 2023 but had to postpone due to weather. Albany County Chair Justin Carman spoke in support of adjourning the hearing, expressing his intention to hold a convention sometime during summer 2023. The original motion for **adjournment of the hearing** passed without objection.

A hearing on revocation of the affiliation of Chenango County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that they are not actively holding meetings, and they have not attempted to hold a convention. Thomas Quiter, Chenango County Chair, has expressed an interest in appointment as County Liaison in the event of revocation of affiliation. Motion by Craig Shute to **revoke the affiliation of Chenango County** was seconded by Brian Wells and passed without objection.

A hearing on revocation of the affiliation of Fulton County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that they are meeting regularly, but with insufficient attendance to hold a convention. The most recent attempt to hold a convention was on September 24, 2022. Motion by Christopher Olenski to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Fulton County until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** passed without objection.

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Montgomery County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that their last meeting was held in early 2022; they are not actively holding meetings; and they have not attempted to hold a convention. Kolstee reported he had sent several warning emails and messages to the current chair. Motion by Christopher Olenski to **revoke the affiliation of Montgomery County** was seconded by Brian Wells and passed 21-3-7. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results)

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Orleans County was held. Motion by James Ziobro to **revoke the affiliation of Orleans County** was seconded by Duane Whitmer, and was debated. Andrew Kolstee reported that they have not attempted a convention, and that there were four (4) different chairs since 2021 due to a variety of reasons. The current Chair Ajay Butcher attempted to hold Zoom meetings, but other officers have refused to attend them. Others allied with former chair Delta Hill (formerly known as Chase Tkach, and reported to be an erstwhile Republican), attempted to remove Butcher in a group-chat, but without an actual Zoom meeting. Due to this disorderly proceeding and other factors mentioned, Andrew Kolstee recommended that the affiliation be revoked. The original motion to **revoke the affiliation of Orleans County** passed without objection.

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Richmond County was held. Andrew Kolstee recommended to adjourn the hearing until after November 7. Thomas Pinkhasov also spoke to the issue, because he was formerly Treasurer and told the Chair Susan Overeem Cummings that he would be traveling. He expressed concern that there were no attempts to meet, and that an additional 3 or 6 months would not work. Motion by Steven Becker to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Richmond County (Staten Island) until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** was seconded by Sean Phelan and passed 14-10-5. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results)

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Schoharie County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported they attempted a convention on April 8, 2023 but had inadequate attendance. Andrew Kolstee recommended to adjourn the hearing until after November 7. Motion by Steven Becker to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Schoharie County until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** was seconded by Sean Phelan and debated, and passed 20-3-6.

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Westchester County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that there has been no attempted convention and that current Chair William Schmidt, the only remaining officer, recommends revocation of affiliation so that a new County Contact can be appointed. Motion by Christopher Olenski to **revoke the affiliation of Westchester County** was seconded by Craig Shute and debated, and passed without objection.

Rules Committee Chair Andrew Kolstee issued a report in writing (**Exhibit 4**). Motion by Michael Rebmann on behalf of the Rules Committee to **adopt Proposal 1** passed without

objection. Motion by Justin Carman on behalf of the Rules Committee to adopt **Proposal 2** passed without objection.

Motion by Chris Olenski on behalf of the Rules Committee to reconsider the vote on **Proposal 1** was seconded by Tom Pinkhasov and debated, and failed 6-20-4. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.)

Motion by Karyn Keniry-Thompson on behalf of the Rules Committee to **adopt Proposal 3** was debated. Motion by Robert Schuon **to amend to strike the words “...at all times”** was seconded by Mark Braiman and passed without objection. The original motion to adopt Proposal 3(K) as amended passed without further objection.

Motion by Daniel Castello on behalf of the Rules Committee to adopt **Proposal 4** was debated. Motion by Robert Schuon **to refer or commit back to the Rules Committee** failed due to lack of a second. The original motion passed 18-4-9. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.)

Platform Committee Chair Mark Glogowski issued a report. Motion by Mark Glogowski that the State Committee **put to a vote six (6) different versions of a platform plank on abortion, allowing the State Committee to choose from among them.** A point of parliamentary inquiry was asked by Mark Braiman to clarify whether Glogowski’s intention was to carry out approval voting as well as a secret ballot using Porcupine, and whether this would be possible or appropriate. Chair Andrew Kolstee ruled to allow a Porcupine ballot with approval voting, using multiple rounds to determine whether the most popular choice could achieve a majority and could receive more votes than NOTA. Justin Carman objected with a point of order asserting that our Special Rules of Order do not provide for such a voting procedure. Andrew Kolstee stated that the point of order is not well taken. Motion by Justin Carman to **challenge the ruling of the Chair** was seconded by Michael Rebmann and debated. The **ruling of the Chair** was not sustained, 10-18-3. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.) Justin Carman objected to the issuance of the Platform Committee Report. Before the Chair issued any ruling on this objection, Mark Glogowski **resigned as Chair and member of the Platform Committee.** Motion by Blay Tarnoff **to populate the Platform Committee with volunteers.** Chair Andrew Kolstee ruled that a formal motion was unnecessary, and instead asked for volunteers for the Platform Committee. Justin Carman, Daniel Castello, Paul Grindle, Jennifer O'Connor, Christopher Olenski, Richard Purtell, Michael Rebmann, Keith Redhead, Robert Schuon, Blay Tarnoff, and Karyn Thompson volunteered, and **were appointed to the Platform Committee** without objection. Chair Andrew Kolstee stated that he will allow them to select a Platform Committee Chair from among themselves.

Motion by Justin Carman **to authorize an additional one thousand two hundred dollars (\$1200) for the contract with Humanitru, to include migration charges,** was seconded by Sean Phelan and passed without objection.

Motion by Sean Phelan to **approve a hearing to consider the removal of Jeffrey Bradley as a member of the State Committee from Judicial District 7 due to abandonment of position** was seconded by Rob Greibesland. Motion by Duane Whitmer to amend in order to consider additionally the removal of Erin Becker, so that the motion would state **“approve a hearing to remove Jeffrey Bradley as a member of the State Committee from Judicial District 7 and Erin Becker as a member of the State Committee from Judicial District 8, due to abandonment of position.”** A point of order was raised by Blay Tarnoff, who stated that the Rules do not allow a hearing for someone who evinces an interest in continuing on the State

Committee, and that Erin Becker's presence at the current meeting indicated her interest. Chair Kolstee asked Erin Becker whether she has intent to continue on the State Committee. Erin Becker affirmed that she does intend to do so. Kolstee ruled that the Whitmer amendment was therefore out of order. A motion to **challenge the ruling of the Chair** by Christopher Olenski was seconded by Justin Carman and debated. **The ruling of the Chair was sustained (upheld) 21-4-2.** (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results. The total of 21 ayes reported here includes a voice vote by Blay Tarnoff, who stated after the Porcupine poll was closed that he had wished to vote Aye but was unable to register his vote in the Porcupine App.) A point of order was raised by Christopher Olenski that the proposed hearing for Jeffrey Bradley's removal is also out of order, since Jeffrey Bradley too had expressed the intent, in a May 30, 2023 email, to attend the current meeting of the State Committee and therefore to continue his position. The Chair agreed that the point of order was well taken, and ruled that the motion to hold a hearing for Jeffrey Bradley was out of order. A **challenge to the ruling of the Chair** by Michael Rebmann was seconded by Justin Carman, and debated. **The ruling of the Chair was sustained (upheld) 17-3-7.** (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results. The total of 17 ayes reported here includes Christopher Olenski who stated after the Porcupine poll was closed that he had wished to vote aye but was unable to register his vote in the Porcupine App.)

Motion by Karyn Keniry-Thompson to **adjourn** was seconded by Robert Schuon and passed 16-1-1. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.)

The meeting was adjourned at 10:49 p.m.

Mark Stephen Braiman,
Secretary.

EXHIBIT 1

CREDENTIALS REPORT

ROLL CALLS (Column #1 at 6:30 p.m., P=Present; #2 indicates a time of later arrival)

JD	State Committee Member	1	2
EO	Richard F. Purtell		
1	Mark N. Axinn		
1	Morry C. Davis		
1	David B. "Chance" Haywood		
2	Paul M. Grindle		
2	Matthew I. Morgan		
2	Gary S. Popkin		
3	William Cody Anderson		
3	Justin N. Carman		
3	Jennifer L. O'Connor		
3	Lora Newell		
4	Amanda H. Ellithorpe		
4	Stephen C. Healey		
4	John A. Janes		
4	Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson		
4	Zachary D. Remian		
4	Brian L. Wells		
5	VACANT		
5	Daniel J. Castello		
5	Shawn C. DeGrand		
5	Matthew K. Guilianelli		
5	Erinn Rose Leatherman		
5	Adam M. Magoon		
5	Keith C.Redhead		

JD	State Committee Member	1	2
5	Craig L. Shute		
6	Mark S. Braiman		
6	Craig Colwell		
6	Christopher M. Olenski		
6	David S. Penner		
6	VACANT		
6	VACANT		
7	Steven G. Becker		
7	Jeffrey C. Bradley		
7	Mark E. Glogowski		
7	Sean C. Phelan		
7	Marc A. Smith		
7	James M. Ziobro		
7	Justin Pelletier		
7	VACANT		
7	VACANT		
8	Erin M. Becker		
8	Maura E. Botsford		
8	Andrew M. Kolstee		
8	Francis Law		
8	Leonard E. Morlock		
8	Michael R. Rebmann		
8	Charles R. Roggen		
8	Jame J. VanDewalker		

JD	State Committee Member	1	2
8	Duane J. Whitmer		
9	Juan R. Ayala		
9	Robert J. Cocomello		
9	Daniel P. Donnelly		
9	Robert J. Greibesland		
9	William K. Schmidt		
9	Christian J. Vondras		
10	Jeffrey J. Denecke		
10	Jonathan H. Gunther		
10	George T. Ostrowski		
10	Robert E. Schuon		
10	Blay Tarnoff		
10	Randyn Tarnoff		
10	VACANT		
10	VACANT		
11	John Clifton		
11	Francisco Oliveira		
11	Irwin Mark Weinblatt		
12	VACANT		
12	VACANT		
13	VACANT		
13	VACANT		
	# Present		
	(out of 58 total)		

Nominations Received: For the vacancy in Judicial District 7, a nomination was received from Justin Pelletier, and the Secretary verified his eligibility.

EXHIBIT 2 (PAGE 1 OF 2)

LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK AGENDA OF THE STATE COMMITTEE OF MONDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2023

6:30 P.M. Call to Order (Andrew Kolstee, Chair)

6:30 P.M. Roll Call and Confirmation of Quorum (Mark Braiman, Secretary)

6:35 P.M. Public Comment

6:40 P.M. Adoption of Agenda

6:45 P.M. Filling of Vacancies on the State Committee

Judicial District 5 (1 vacancy)
Judicial District 6 (2 vacancies)
Judicial District 7 (3 vacancies)
Judicial District 10 (2 vacancies)
Judicial District 12 (2 vacancies)
Judicial District 13 (2 vacancies)

7:00 P.M. Continuation of Election of Platform Committee Representative

7:15 P.M. Election of Platform Committee Alternate Representative

7:30 P.M. Election of Credentials Committee Representative

7:45 P.M. Election of Credentials Committee Alternate Representative

8:00 P.M. Hearings to Consider Revocation of County Affiliates

Albany County
Fulton County
Richmond County (Staten Island)
Schoharie County

8:30 P.M. Hearing Requests

Consideration to approve a hearing to consider the revocation of the affiliation of New York County (Manhattan)

8:40 P.M. Treasurer's Report (Cody Anderson)

8:50 P.M. Chair's Report (Andrew Kolstee)

8:55 P.M. Platform Committee Report (Daniel Castello)

EXHIBIT 2 (PAGE 2 OF 2)

9:00 P.M. Committee on State Committee Elections Report (Andrew Kolstee)

9:05 P.M. Old Business

9:30 P.M. New Business

Consideration to set the date of the Nominating Convention for the weekend of March 16-17, 2024 at a location to be determined by the Executive Committee.

Consideration to set the date of the State Convention for the weekend of September 21-22, 2024 at a location to be determined by the Executive Committee.

Consideration of the creation of a Delegate Selection Committee for the purpose of establishing a rubric, including presenting to the State Committee potential amendments to the Rules of the Libertarian Party, including the possibility of inserting the rubric in the Rules.

10:30 P.M. Adjournment

EXHIBIT 4

REPORT OF THE RULES COMMITTEE FOR THE STATE COMMITTEE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 11, 2023

PROPOSAL 1 (A2). Allow pre-registered as members.

5.1. **GENERAL.** The membership of the LPNY shall consist of individuals who are registered **or pre-registered voters to vote** in the State of New York, **and** who either 1) are enrolled in the “Libertarian Party” in the records of the New York State Board of Elections; or 2) are enrolled with no party or blank in the records of the New York State Board of Elections but have registered with the LPNY for the purpose of being an official member of the LPNY. Any reference to “LPNY Member(s)” hereinafter shall mean member(s) of the LPNY as defined in this section.

PROPOSAL 2 (B). Use LPedia instead of the “master book”

6.5.3. **SECRETARY.** The Secretary shall keep an accurate and complete record of the proceedings of all meetings of the State Committee and shall keep these records up-to-date and in order **in the master book at the LPedia page** containing the official minutes of the LPNY. At meetings of the State Committee and the Executive Committee, the Secretary shall present the minutes of the previous respective meeting for approval. In all elections and roll call votes, the Secretary shall call the roll of the voting members and shall keep an accurate tally of such votes. The Secretary with unanimous consent may dispense with a roll call vote. The Secretary may appoint assistants for this purpose and, in contested elections, with the consent of a majority of the members of the State Committee present and voting shall appoint an Elections Board which shall include one representative of each contestant in question plus one additional member, so that the Board shall consist of an odd number of persons.

PROPOSAL 3 (E2). Allow Chair to remove members and chairs of special committees.

10.1. **GENERAL.** The State Committee shall have the power to create and dissolve standing committees, and to appoint and remove chairs of these committees. The Chair of the State Committee shall have the power to create special committees and appoint **and remove** their members and chair.