

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE COMMITTEE
OF THE LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON SUNDAY, JUNE 4, 2023
ON THE ZOOM MEETING APP AND PORCUPINE APP**

MEMBERS PRESENT (31)

Richard F. Purtell (*ex officio*)
Mark N. Axinn (JD1)
Gary S. Popkin (JD2)
William Cody Anderson (JD3)
Justin N. Carman (JD3)
Jennifer L. O'Connor (JD3)
Lora Newell (JD3)
John A. Janes (JD4)
Zachary D. Remian (JD4)
Karen A. Keniry-Thompson (JD4)
Daniel J. Castello (JD5)
Shawn C. DeGrand (JD5)
Matthew K. Guilianelli (JD5)
Erinn Rose Leatherman (JD5)
Adam M. Magoon (JD5)
Keith C. Redhead (JD5)
Craig L. Shute (JD5)
Mark S. Braiman (JD6)
Christopher M. Olenski (JD6)
David S. Penner (JD6)
Craig L. Colwell (JD6)
Steven G. Becker (JD7)
Mark E. Glogowski (JD7)

Sean C. Phelan (JD7)
Marc A. Smith (JD7)
James M. Ziobro (JD7)
Maura E. Botsford (JD8)
Andrew M. Kolstee (JD8)
Frances Law (JD8)
Leonard E. Morlock (JD8)
Michael R. Rebmann (JD8)
Charles R. Roggen (JD8)
Jame J. VanDewalker (JD8)
Duane Whitmer (JD8)
Daniel P. Donnelly (JD9)
William K. Schmidt (JD9)
Jeffrey J. Denecke (JD10)
Jonathan H. Gunther (JD10)
Blay Tarnoff (JD10)
Irwin Mark Weinblatt (JD11)
John Clifton (JD11)
Thomas Pinkhasov (JD13)

MEMBERS ABSENT (22)

Morry C. Davis (JD1)

Chance Haywood (JD1)
Paul M. Grindle (JD2)
Matthew I. Morgan (JD2)
Amanda H. Ellithorpe (JD4)
Stephen C. Healey (JD3)
Brian L. Wells (JD4)
Jacob T. Cornell (JD5)
Keith D. Price (JD6)
Jeffrey C. Bradley (JD7)
Erin M. Becker (JD8)
Juan R. Ayala (JD9)
Robert J. Cocomello (JD9)
Robert J. Greibesland (JD9)
Christian J. Vondras (JD9)
George T. Ostrowski (JD10)
Robert E. Schuon (JD10)
Randyn Tarnoff (JD10)
Scott W. Thompson (JD10)
Angelo E. Veltri (JD11)
Francisco Olvera (JD11)
Fredy O. Calvache (JD13)

The meeting was called to order at 7:06 p.m. by Andrew Kolstee, Chair. Secretary Mark Braiman conducted a roll call and determined that a quorum was present.

A request for public comment by Chair Andrew Kolstee received no comments.

The Credentials and Nominations Report (**Exhibit 1**) indicated that there were thirty-one (31) of fifty-nine (59) voting members of the State Committee present at the time of roll call. Four (4) later entered the meeting, to give thirty-five (35) members present out of fifty-nine (59) members of the State Committee after the filling of vacancies. The Secretary determined that a quorum was present at all times during the meeting.

The **Agenda (Exhibit 2)** was adopted without objection

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of one (1) State Committee vacancy from Judicial District 5. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling this vacancy until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of two (2) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 6. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling these vacancies until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of three (3) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 7. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling these vacancies until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of two (2) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 10. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling these vacancies until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of two (2) State Committee vacancies from Judicial District 12. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling these vacancies until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Chair Andrew Kolstee called for the filling of one (1) State Committee vacancy from Judicial District 13. Secretary Mark Braiman reported that no one had been nominated in advance. Chair Andrew Kolstee, hearing no nominations from the floor, postponed filling this vacancy until the next meeting of the State Committee.

Treasurer William Cody Anderson issued a Treasurer's Report in writing (**Exhibit 3**) and the report **was accepted** without objection.

Field Development Director Andrew Kolstee issued a report regarding the level of progress by County Affiliates on meeting criteria required for recertification. Motion by Justin Carman to **certify that the County Affiliate in Wayne County has met the criteria required in Article 11.2.3. of the Rules of the Libertarian Party of New York** was seconded by Sean Phelan and passed without objection.

A hearing on revocation of the affiliation of Albany County was held. Motion by Mark Braiman to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Albany County until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** was seconded by Richard Purtell and debated. Mark Braiman stated his reason for proposing the adjournment was that Andrew Kolstee reported Albany County had attempted to hold its convention on March 14, 2023 but had to postpone due to weather. Albany County Chair Justin Carman spoke in support of adjourning the hearing, expressing his intention to hold a convention sometime during summer 2023. The original motion for **adjournment of the hearing** passed without objection.

A hearing on revocation of the affiliation of Chenango County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that they are not actively holding meetings, and they have not attempted to hold a

convention. Thomas Quiter, Chenango County Chair, has expressed an interest in appointment as County Liaison in the event of revocation of affiliation. Motion by Craig Shute to **revoke the affiliation of Chenango County** was seconded by Brian Wells and passed without objection.

A hearing on revocation of the affiliation of Fulton County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that they are meeting regularly, but with insufficient attendance to hold a convention. The most recent attempt to hold a convention was on September 24, 2022. Motion by Christopher Olenski to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Fulton County until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** passed without objection.

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Montgomery County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that their last meeting was held in early 2022; they are not actively holding meetings; and they have not attempted to hold a convention. Kolstee reported he had sent several warning emails and messages to the current chair. Motion by Christopher Olenski to **revoke the affiliation of Montgomery County** was seconded by Brian Wells and passed 21-3-7. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results)

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Orleans County was held. Motion by James Ziobro to **revoke the affiliation of Orleans County** was seconded by Duane Whitmer, and was debated. Andrew Kolstee reported that they have not attempted a convention, and that there were four (4) different chairs since 2021 due to a variety of reasons. The current Chair Ajay Butcher attempted to hold Zoom meetings, but other officers have refused to attend them. Others allied with former chair Delta Hill (formerly known as Chase Tkach, and reported to be an erstwhile Republican), attempted to remove A.J. Butcher in a group-chat, but without an actual Zoom meeting. Due to this disorderly proceeding and other factors mentioned, Andrew Kolstee recommended that the affiliation be revoked. The original motion to **revoke the affiliation of Orleans County** passed without objection.

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Richmond County was held. Andrew Kolstee recommended to adjourn the hearing until after November 7. Thomas Pinkhasov also spoke to the issue, because he was formerly Treasurer and told the Chair Susan Overeem Cummings that he would be traveling. He expressed concern that there were no attempts to meet, and that an additional 3 or 6 months would not work. Motion by Steven Becker to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Richmond County (Staten Island) until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** was seconded by Sean Phelan and passed 14-10-5. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results)

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Schoharie County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported they attempted a convention on April 8, 2023 but had inadequate attendance. Andrew Kolstee recommended to adjourn the hearing until after November 7. Motion by Steven Becker to **adjourn the hearing to consider revocation of the affiliation of Schoharie County until the first State Committee meeting after the November 7, 2023 election** was seconded by Sean Phelan and debated, and passed 20-3-6. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.)

A hearing on the revocation of the affiliation of Westchester County was held. Andrew Kolstee reported that there has been no attempted convention and that current Chair William Schmidt, the only remaining officer, recommends revocation of affiliation so that a new County Contact can be appointed. Motion by Christopher Olenski to **revoke the affiliation of Westchester County** was seconded by Craig Shute and debated, and passed without objection.

Rules Committee Chair Andrew Kolstee issued a report in writing (**Exhibit 5**). Motion by Michael Rebmann on behalf of the Rules Committee to **adopt Proposal 1** passed without objection. Motion by Justin Carman on behalf of the Rules Committee to adopt **Proposal 2** passed without objection.

Motion by Chris Olenski on behalf of the Rules Committee to reconsider the vote on **Proposal 1** was seconded by Tom Pinkhasov and debated, and failed 6-20-4. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.)

Motion by Karyn Keniry-Thompson on behalf of the Rules Committee to **adopt Proposal 3** was debated. Motion by Robert Schuon to **amend to strike the words “...at all times”** was seconded by Mark Braiman and passed without objection. The original motion to adopt Proposal 3(K) as amended passed without further objection.

Motion by Daniel Castello on behalf of the Rules Committee to adopt **Proposal 4** was debated. Motion by Robert Schuon to **refer or commit back to the Rules Committee** failed due to lack of a second. The original motion passed 18-4-9. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.)

Platform Committee Chair Mark Glogowski issued a report. Motion by Mark Glogowski that the State Committee **put to a vote six (6) different versions of a platform plank on abortion, allowing the State Committee to choose from among them.** A point of parliamentary inquiry was asked by Mark Braiman to clarify whether Glogowski’s intention was to carry out approval voting as well as a secret ballot using Porcupine, and whether this would be possible or appropriate. Chair Andrew Kolstee ruled to allow a Porcupine ballot with approval voting, using multiple rounds to determine whether the most popular choice could achieve a majority and could receive more votes than NOTA. Justin Carman objected with a point of order asserting that our Special Rules of Order do not provide for such a voting procedure. Andrew Kolstee stated that the point of order is not well taken. Motion by Justin Carman to **challenge the ruling of the Chair** was seconded by Michael Rebmann and debated. The **ruling of the Chair** was not sustained, 10-18-3. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.) Justin Carman objected to the issuance of the Platform Committee Report. Before the Chair issued any ruling on this objection, Mark Glogowski **resigned as Chair and member of the Platform Committee.** Motion by Blay Tarnoff to **populate the Platform Committee with volunteers.** Chair Andrew Kolstee ruled that a formal motion was unnecessary, and instead asked for volunteers for the Platform Committee. Justin Carman, Daniel Castello, Paul Grindle, Jennifer O'Connor, Christopher Olenski, Richard Purtell, Michael Rebmann, Keith Redhead, Robert Schuon, Blay Tarnoff, and Karyn Thompson volunteered, and **were appointed to the Platform Committee** without objection. Chair Andrew Kolstee stated that he will allow them to select a Platform Committee Chair from among themselves.

Motion by Justin Carman to **authorize an additional one thousand two hundred dollars (\$1200) for the contract with Humanitru, to include migration charges,** was seconded by Sean Phelan and passed without objection.

Motion by Sean Phelan to **approve a hearing to consider the removal of Jeffrey Bradley as a member of the State Committee from Judicial District 7 due to abandonment of position** was seconded by Rob Greibesland. Motion by Duane Whitmer to amend in order to consider additionally the removal of Erin Becker, so that the motion would state **“approve a hearing to**

remove Jeffrey Bradley as a member of the State Committee from Judicial District 7 and Erin Becker as a member of the State Committee from Judicial District 8, due to abandonment of position.” A point of order was raised by Blay Tarnoff, who stated that the Rules do not allow a hearing for someone who evinces an interest in continuing on the State Committee, and that Erin Becker’s presence at the current meeting indicated her interest. Chair Kolstee asked Erin Becker whether she has intent to continue on the State Committee. Erin Becker affirmed that she does intend to do so. Kolstee ruled that the Whitmer amendment was therefore out of order. A motion to **challenge the ruling of the Chair** by Christopher Olenski was seconded by Justin Carman and debated. **The ruling of the Chair was sustained (upheld) 21-4-2.** (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results. The total of 21 ayes reported here includes a voice vote by Blay Tarnoff, who stated after the Porcupine poll was closed that he had wished to vote Aye but was unable to register his vote in the Porcupine App.) A point of order was raised by Christopher Olenski that the proposed hearing for Jeffrey Bradley’s removal is also out of order, since Jeffrey Bradley too had expressed the intent, in a May 30, 2023 email, to attend the current meeting of the State Committee and therefore to continue his position. The Chair agreed that the point of order was well taken, and ruled that the motion to hold a hearing for Jeffrey Bradley was out of order. A **challenge to the ruling of the Chair** by Michael Rebmann was seconded by Justin Carman, and debated. **The ruling of the Chair was sustained (upheld) 17-3-7.** (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results. The total of 17 ayes reported here includes Christopher Olenski who stated after the Porcupine poll was closed that he had wished to vote aye but was unable to register his vote in the Porcupine App.)

Motion by Karyn Keniry-Thompson to **adjourn** was seconded by Robert Schuon and passed 16-1-1. (See **Exhibit 4** for detailed results.)

The meeting was adjourned at 10:49 p.m.

Mark Stephen Braiman,
Secretary.

EXHIBIT 1

CREDENTIALS REPORT

ROLL CALLS (Column #1 at 5:06 p.m., P=Present; #2 indicates a time of later arrival)

JD	State Committee Member	#1	#2
EO	Richard Purtell	P	
1	Mark Axinn		
1	Morry Davis		7:41
1	Chance Haywood		
2	Paul Grindle		8:01
2	Matthew Morgan		
2	Gary Popkin		
3	William Cody Anderson		
3	Justin Carman	P	
3	Lora Newell		
3	Jennifer O'Connor	P	
4	Amanda Ellithorpe		
4	Stephen Healey		
4	John Janes	P	
4	Zachary Remian		
4	Karyn Keniry Thompson	P	
4	Brian Wells	P	
5	Daniel Castello	P	
5	VACANT		
5	Shawn DeGrand	P	
5	Matthew Guilianelli	P	
5	Erinn Rose Leatherman		
5	Adam Magoon		

JD	State Committee Member	#1	#2
5	Keith Redhead	P	
5	Craig Shute	P	
6	Mark Braiman	P	
6	Christopher Olenski	P	
6	David Penner	P	
6	VACANT		
6	Craig Colwell	P	
6	VACANT		
7	Steven G. Becker	P	
7	Jeffrey Bradley		
7	Mark Glogowski		8:45
7	Sean Phelan	P	
7	Marc Smith		9:00
7	James Ziobro	P	
7	VACANT		
7	VACANT		
7	VACANT		
8	Erin Becker		9:00
8	Maura Botsford	P	
8	Andrew Kolstee	P	
8	Frances Law	P	
8	Leonard Morlock		
8	Michael Rebmann	P	

JD	State Committee Member	#1	#2
8	Charles Roggen		7:45
8	Jame VanDewalker		
8	Duane Whitmer	P	
9	Juan Ayala		
9	Robert Cocomello	P	
9	Daniel Donnelly		
9	Robert Greibesland	P	
9	William Schmidt		
9	Christian Vondras		
10	Jeffrey Denecke		
10	Jonathan Gunther	P	
10	George Ostrowski		
10	Robert Schuon		
10	Blay Tarnoff	P	
10	Randyn Tarnoff	P	
10	VACANT		
10	VACANT		
11	Irwin Mark Weinblatt	P	
11	John Clifton	P	
11	Francisco Oliveira		
12	VACANT		
13	Thomas Pinkhasov	P	
	# Present	31	6

EXHIBIT 2 (PAGE 1 OF 2)

LIBERTARIAN PARTY OF NEW YORK AGENDA OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING OF JUNE 4, 2023

7:00 P.M. Call to Order (Andrew Kolstee, Chair)

7:00 P.M. Roll Call and Confirmation of Quorum (Mark Braiman, Secretary)

7:05 P.M. Public Comment

7:15 P.M. Adoption of Agenda

7:20 P.M. Filling of Vacancies on the State Committee

Judicial District 5 (1 vacancy)
Judicial District 6 (2 vacancies)
Judicial District 7 (3 vacancies)
Judicial District 10 (2 vacancies)
Judicial District 12 (2 vacancies)
Judicial District 13 (1 vacancy)

8:00 P.M. Treasurer's Report (Cody Anderson)

8:10 P.M. Chair's Report (Andrew Kolstee)

8:20 P.M. Field Development Division Report (Andrew Kolstee)

Consideration to certify that the County Affiliate in Wayne County has met the criteria required in Article 11.2.3. of the Rules of the Libertarian Party of New York.

8:25 P.M. Hearings to Consider Revocation of Affiliation of of County Affiliates

1. **Albany** (attempted convention: March 14, 2023)
2. **Chenango** (no attempted convention). Not actively holding meetings.
3. **Fulton** (attempted convention: September 24, 2022). Actively holding meetings.
4. **Montgomery** (no attempted convention). Not actively holding meetings. Last meeting held in early 2022.
5. **Orleans** (no attempted convention). Not actively holding meetings. Last meeting held in early 2022.
6. **Otsego** (no attempted convention). Not actively holding meetings. Last meeting held in late 2021.
7. **Richmond** (no attempted convention). Not actively holding meetings.
8. **Schoharie** (attempted convention: April 8, 2023)
9. **Westchester** (no attempted convention). Chair William Schmidt, the only remaining officer, recommends revocation of affiliation so that a new County can be appointed.

EXHIBIT 2 (PAGE 2 OF 2)

Potential Outcomes:

- Motion to adjourn the hearing to consider the revocation of the County Affiliate in _____ County until the first meeting of the full State Committee after the November 7, 2023 general election
- Motion to revoke the affiliation of the County Organization in _____ County effective June 30, 2023.
- No Action

9:30 P.M. Rules Committee Report (Andrew Kolstee)

Consideration to adopt proposed amendments to the Rules. See [here](#).

9:45 P.M. Platform Committee Report (Mark Glogowski)

10:00 P.M. Old Business

Amending motion to authorize funds for Humanitru CRM database. An additional \$1,200 needs to be authorized.

10:30 P.M. New Business

State Committee members who have missed 2 or more consecutive meetings in both attendance and/or participation and are eligible for removal due to abandonment as follows. The Executive Committee has requested a hearing be held for those who do not attend the June 4, 2023 meeting:

- Jeffrey Bradley (JD7) - missed all 4 meetings
- Erin Becker (JD8) - missed last 3 meetings
- Robert Cocomello (JD9) - missed last 3 meetings
- Robert Greibesland (JD9) - missed last 3 meetings
- Randyn Tarnoff (JD10) - missed last 3 meetings

Consideration to **approve a hearing to be held by the State Committee in accordance with Article 12 of the Rules of the Libertarian Party for the purpose of considering the removal of Jeffrey Bradley (JD 7), Erin Becker (JD 8), Robert Cocomello (JD 9), Robert Greibesland (JD 9), and Randyn Tarnoff (JD 10) as members of the State Committee**

11:00 P.M. Adjournment

EXHIBIT 3 (PAGE 1 OF 2)

LPNY Treasurer's Report June 4, 2023

Housekeeping Committee account balance as of June 4, 2023: **\$1123.86** (no change since May 21)

Constituted Committee account balance as of June 4, 2023: **\$29,579.87** (+\$4412.73 since May 21)

LPNY 2022 Petitioning Committee account balance as of June 4, 2023: **\$0** (-\$4335.95 since May 21)

Deposits to Housekeeping account since May 21:

None

Disbursements from Housekeeping account since May 21:

none

Deposits to CC account since May 21:

Net Donations - \$476.78

Transfer in from 2022 Petitioning Account: \$3935.95

Disbursements from CC account since May 21:

None

Deposits to petitioning account since May 21:

none

Disbursements from petitioning account since May 21:

William Ostrowski - \$400.00 (cleared)

Transfer out to CC account - \$3935.95

EXHIBIT 3 (PAGE 2 OF 2)

All funds remaining in the petitioning account (\$3935.95) have been transferred to the CC account. This effectively closes the account, and the 2022 Petitioning Committee will be dissolved presently.

For the state committee's reference, a summary of monthly donation income since the current state committee was seated appears below. We have seen monthly income trending downward since November 2022.

Oct 22 - \$1005.75

Nov 22 - \$1663.41

Dec 22 - \$1455.07

Jan 23 - \$1019.95

Feb 23 - \$1285.21

Mar 23 - \$1193.01

Apr 23 - \$1032.17

May 23 - \$825.60

Although our recurring monthly expenses have held steady for some time, the implementation of the Humanitru CRM system will have significant one-time (\$1200) and recurring costs (\$3000/year) that we will need to cover going forward.

In short: monthly revenue must be increased significantly in order to adequately cover both our additional recurring expenses, as well as the unexpected expenses, such as for legal and candidate support, we are certain to incur. I defer to the Finance Director to speak to the ways in which he intends to attain the means we require, and to the Communications Director to speak to progress made on resuming our email outreach, which has traditionally been our best opportunity to energize our base and ask for donations periodically.

Respectfully submitted,

W. Cody Anderson
Treasurer

EXHIBIT 4 (PAGE 1 OF 3)

Shall we revoke the affiliation of the county affiliate in Montgomery County?

21 AYE - 88% 3 NAY - 13% 7 ABSTAIN 0 INVALID 0 DUPLICATE 31 TOTAL

Robert Cocomello 1 James Ziobro 1 Craig Shute 1 Jonathan Gunther 1 Daniel Castello 1 Keith Redhead 1
 Duane J. Whitmer 1 Mark Braiman 1 Sean C. Phelan 1 John A. Janes 1 Randyn Tarnoff 1 Irwin Mark Weinblatt 1
 Rich Purtell 1 Thomas Pinkhasov 1 Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson 1 David Penner 1 Robert J. Greibesland 1 Justin Carman 1
 Matthew Guilianelli 1 Brian Wells 1 Shawn DeGrand 1 Maura Botsford 1 Blay Tarnoff 1 Craig Colwell 1 Michael Rebmann 1
 Christopher Olenski 1 Charles Roggen 1 Francis Law 1 Marc Smith 1 Jennifer O'Connor 1 Steven G. Becker 1

Shall we reconsider the vote on proposal 1 of the Rules Committee Report?

6 AYE - 23% 20 NAY - 77% 4 ABSTAIN 1 INVALID 0 DUPLICATE 31 TOTAL

Christopher Olenski 1 James Ziobro 1 Sean C. Phelan 1 John A. Janes 1 Irwin Mark Weinblatt 1 Justin Carman 1
 Daniel Castello 1 Robert Schuon 1 Marc Smith 1 Rich Purtell 1 Francis Law 1 Robert J. Greibesland 1 Jonathan Gunther 1
 Randyn Tarnoff 1 Blay Tarnoff 1 Michael Rebmann 1 Brian Wells 1 Shawn DeGrand 1 Jennifer O'Connor 1
 Mark E. Glogowski 1 Steven G. Becker 1 Duane J. Whitmer 1 Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson 1 Charles Roggen 1 Craig Colwell 1
 Keith Redhead 1 Paul Grindle 1 Thomas Pinkhasov 1 Matthew Guilianelli 1 David Penner 1 Robert Cocomello 1

Shall we adopt proposal 4 of the Rules Committee Report as an amendment to the rules?

18 AYE - 82% 4 NAY - 18% 9 ABSTAIN 0 INVALID 1 DUPLICATE 32 TOTAL

Thomas Pinkhasov 1 Robert Schuon 1 Sean C. Phelan 1 Rich Purtell 1 Mark Braiman 1 Christopher Olenski 1
 Duane J. Whitmer 1 Michael Rebmann 1 Mark E. Glogowski 1 Irwin Mark Weinblatt 1 Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson 1
 David Penner 1 Blay Tarnoff 1 Robert Cocomello 1 Brian Wells 1 Steven G. Becker 1 Francis Law 1 John A. Janes 1
 Justin Carman 1 Robert J. Greibesland 1 Marc Smith 1 Randyn Tarnoff 1 Charles Roggen 1 Jonathan Gunther 1
 Craig Colwell 1 Keith Redhead 1 Morry Davis 2 Matthew Guilianelli 1 Daniel Castello 1 Jennifer O'Connor 1
 Shawn DeGrand 1

EXHIBIT 4 (PAGE 2 OF 3)

Shall we uphold the ruling of the Chair that the ballot on abortion is in order? (Voting Aye sustains the ruling of the chair and we continue with the described ballot).

10 AYE - 36% 18 NAY - 64% 3 ABSTAIN 0 INVALID 0 DUPLICATE 31 TOTAL

Blay Tarnoff 1 Daniel Castello 1 Robert Schuon 1 Justin Carman 1 David Penner 1 Keith Redhead 1 Duane J. Whitmer 1
Maura Botsford 1 Mark E. Glogowski 1 Robert Cocomello 1 Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson 1 Michael Rebmann 1
Irwin Mark Weinblatt 1 James Ziobro 1 Francis Law 1 Rich Purtell 1 John A. Janes 1 Matthew Guilianelli 1 Mark Braiman 1
Sean C. Phelan 1 Jonathan Gunther 1 Marc Smith 1 Randyn Tarnoff 1 Christopher Olenski 1 Brian Wells 1
Shawn DeGrand 1 Morry Davis 1 Paul Grindle 1 Robert J. Greibesland 1 Craig Colwell 1 Jennifer O'Connor 1

Shall we sustain (uphold) the ruling of the chair that the motion to consider approving a hearing to remove Erin Becker is out of order? (An AYE vote means we no longer consider a hearing for Ms. Becker)

20 AYE - 83% 4 NAY - 17% 2 ABSTAIN 0 INVALID 2 DUPLICATE 28 TOTAL

Duane J. Whitmer 2 David Penner 2 Sean C. Phelan 1 Mark Braiman 1 Paul Grindle 1 Robert Cocomello 1 Rich Purtell 1
Robert Schuon 1 Marc Smith 1 Daniel Castello 1 Francis Law 1 Jennifer O'Connor 1 Irwin Mark Weinblatt 1
Steven G. Becker 1 John A. Janes 1 Maura Botsford 1 Brian Wells 1 Michael Rebmann 1 Justin Carman 1
Robert J. Greibesland 1 Mark E. Glogowski 1 Shawn DeGrand 1 Randyn Tarnoff 1 Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson 1
Jonathan Gunther 1 Morry Davis 1

EXHIBIT 4 (PAGE 3 OF 3)

Shall we sustain (uphold) the ruling of the chair that the motion to consider approving a hearing to remove Jeff Bradley is out of order?
(An AYE vote means we no longer consider a hearing for Mr. Bradley)

16 AYE - 84% 3 NAY - 16% 7 ABSTAIN 1 INVALID 0 DUPLICATE 27 TOTAL

David Penner 1 Robert Schuon 1 Mark Braiman 1 Daniel Castello 1 Rich Purtell 1 Jennifer O'Connor 1
Irwin Mark Weinblatt 1 Randyn Tarnoff 1 Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson 1 John A. Janes 1 Robert J. Greibesland 1 Francis Law 1
Duane J. Whitmer 1 Michael Rebmann 1 Shawn DeGrand 1 Marc Smith 1 Mark E. Glogowski 1 Justin Carman 1
Erin M. Becker 1 Blay Tarnoff 1 Maura Botsford 1 Morry Davis 1 Jonathan Gunther 1 Keith Redhead 1 Brian Wells 1
Paul Grindle 1 Steven G. Becker 1

Shall we adjourn?

16 AYE - 94% 1 NAY - 6% 1 ABSTAIN 0 INVALID 0 DUPLICATE 18 TOTAL

Robert J. Greibesland 1 Daniel Castello 1 Rich Purtell 1 Steven G. Becker 1 Robert Schuon 1 John A. Janes 1
David Penner 1 Randyn Tarnoff 1 Francis Law 1 Keith Redhead 1 Brian Wells 1 Karyn A. Keniry-Thompson 1
Irwin Mark Weinblatt 1 Justin Carman 1 Matthew Guilianelli 1 Mark Braiman 1 Marc Smith 1 Jonathan Gunther 1

EXHIBIT 5 (PAGE 1 OF 2)

REPORT OF THE RULES COMMITTEE FOR THE STATE COMMITTEE MEETING OF JUNE 4, 2023

PROPOSAL 1 (G). This is a legacy provision for meetings held in person (we have a new Article 8.3 for that) and the first sentence on allowing teleconferencing is already mentioned in Article 8.1. Moved the one sentence up and reworded.

8.1. **GENERAL.** Meetings of the State Committee and of the Executive Committee shall be conducted in accordance with the provisions in this article. Meetings shall be held in-person, by electronic means, or a combination thereof, in which case all members shall have the same rights and privileges regardless of means of attending. Meetings of the Executive Committee shall be open to observation by all members of the State Committee and officers of County Affiliates upon request, with the exception of Executive Session. The Organization Meeting and meetings held for the purpose of nominating statewide candidates must be held in person, except as provided in Article 8.3.

~~8.6. MEETINGS HELD IN PERSON. At in-person meetings of the State Committee, teleconferencing is permitted; teleconferencing members shall have the same rights and privileges as those attending in person.~~

PROPOSAL 2 (H). Cleanup all policies on voting. Move Article 8.4.2 up to a new, single article on voting. Moved 7.6 (voting of the Executive Committee) from the previous article and merging them. Moved 6.9 (voting regarding State Committee) and also merging it here.

8.4. VOTING.

8.4.1. **VOTING MEMBERS.** The LPNY members elected to the State Committee at the most recent election of the State Committee or elected to fill a vacancy during the term of ~~to~~ the State Committee in accordance with these Rules ~~at the most recent election~~ shall be the voting members, ~~of the Organization Meeting~~ except that only LPNY Members elected to the Executive Committee shall be the voting members at the meeting of that body.

8.4.2. **NUMBER OF VOTES.** ~~7.6. VOTING. Each member of the Executive Committee shall have one vote.~~ ~~6.9. VOTING.~~ In all meetings, each member of the ~~State Committee~~ respective committee shall be entitled to a single non-transferable vote, except on all votes pertaining to the designation, nomination, substitution, or authorization of a candidate for statewide office, each member of the State Committee shall cast the whole number of votes cast for Governor from the Unit of Representation as described in Article 6.3, on the line or column of the Libertarian Party in the last preceding general election for Governor.

8.4.3. **MISCELLANEOUS VOTING RULES.** [from 7.6] There shall be no proxy voting. Voting on any issue ~~before the Executive Committee~~ may be conducted through electronic means or written ballot.

[Renumber after Article 8.4 and Article 6.9 above accordingly]

8.4. ORGANIZATION MEETING. ...

~~8.4.2. VOTING MEMBERS. The members elected to the State Committee in accordance with these Rules at the most recent election shall be the voting members of the Organization Meeting.~~

EXHIBIT 5 (PAGE 2 OF 2)

PROPOSAL 3 (K). Adding policies for committee record keeping.

10.4. **RECORDS.** All committees shall keep a record of their proceedings. The Secretary shall keep a record of all committees and their membership. The Chairs of all committees must maintain a digital roster of all current committee members, a list of dates meetings were held and the attendance of those meetings, that is accessible at all times to the Chair and Secretary.

PROPOSAL 4. (L). Reorganizing County Contacts section.

11.1.1.2. ~~COUNTY CONTACTS. UNORGANIZED COUNTIES.~~ An unorganized county is ~~In~~ any county in which ~~where~~ no recognized County Affiliate exists. ~~†~~The State Committee may appoint an Acting County Chair and County Representative from among the LPNY Member(s) in that county. ~~one or more enrolled members of the Libertarian Party to serve as County Contacts for the purpose of organizing a County Organization. The State Committee shall also designate by appointment the Lead County Contact, who is responsible for organizing meetings. Upon establishment of a County Organization, the duly elected Chair shall replace the County Contact as the State Committee's primary contact for a given county.~~ Both positions may be held by the same person.

11.2.1. **ACTING COUNTY CHAIR.** The Acting Chair of an unorganized county is responsible for holding a meeting or event no less than twice per quarter and promoting them for the purpose of ultimately organizing a County Affiliate and building a Libertarian Party presence in the county.

11.2.2. **COUNTY LIAISON.** The County Representative of an unorganized county is responsible for serving as the liaison of the unorganized county to the State Committee.

11.1.1.2.3. **TERMS.** ~~County Contacts~~ Acting County Chairs and County Liaisons shall serve until the end of the succeeding calendar quarter, subject to renewal or removal by the State Committee. Each renewal ~~of a County Contact~~ shall expire at the end of the succeeding calendar quarter.